Successes and Challenges in Services for Victims of Sex Trafficking: An Organizational Analysis

Annelieke Sinnema
South Dakota State University

Follow this and additional works at: https://openprairie.sdstate.edu/etd
Part of the Sociology Commons

Recommended Citation
https://openprairie.sdstate.edu/etd/2670
SUCCESSES AND CHALLENGES IN SERVICES FOR VICTIMS OF SEX TRAFFICKING: AN ORGANIZATIONAL ANALYSIS

BY
ANNELIEKE SINNEMA

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master of Science Major in Sociology South Dakota State University 2018
SUCCESSSES AND CHALLENGES IN SERVICES FOR VICTIMS OF SEX TRAFFICKING: AN ORGANIZATIONAL ANALYSIS

ANNELEKE SINNEMA

This thesis is approved as a creditable and independent investigation by a candidate for the Master of Science in Sociology degree and is acceptable for meeting the dissertation requirements for this degree. Acceptance of this does not imply that the conclusions reached by the candidate are necessarily the conclusions of the major department.

Julie Ying Jing, Ph.D
Thesis Advisor

Mary Emery, Ph.D.
Date
Head, Department of Sociology and Rural Studies

Dean, Graduate School
Date
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First, I would like to thank the clients of Calltofreedom for participating in this research. I want to thank them for the trust they had in me and this project and the openness in which they answered my questions. I am honored to have been able to talk to you and see human trafficking through different eyes.

Secondly, I want to thank all the staff members of Calltofreedom, other service organizations and law enforcement agencies who participated in this project. Thank you for your time and knowledge about this topic and willingness to share your information with me.

Lastly, I want to thank my advisor, Dr. Julie Yingling, for her encouragement and guidance throughout this project. Your advice and enthusiasm have helped me to keep going when things got rough. I also want to thank Dr. Meredith Redlin and Dr. Dwayne Beck for being on my committee and taking the time to read my research.
# CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................................................ vi

Introduction ..................................................................................................................................... 1

Literature review.............................................................................................................................. 4

  Social and legal definitions of trafficking ................................................................................. 4
  LGBTQ Youth ........................................................................................................................... 8
  Violence Against Women Act (VAWA) ......................................................................................... 9

Places of trafficking .................................................................................................................... 11

Events related to trafficking in South Dakota ............................................................................ 12

South Dakota tier ranking .......................................................................................................... 14

South Dakota law changes ......................................................................................................... 15

Barriers in awareness, response and services ........................................................................... 19

Purpose statement ........................................................................................................................ 21

Theoretical framework .................................................................................................................. 22

  Labeling theory ....................................................................................................................... 22
  Memorable messages ............................................................................................................... 24

Research methods ......................................................................................................................... 27

  Research site ........................................................................................................................... 27

  Sampling ..................................................................................................................................... 27

  Data collection .......................................................................................................................... 30

Analysis ...................................................................................................................................... 31

Findings 1: Successes and challenges regarding Calltofreedom .................................................... 33

  Needs ......................................................................................................................................... 33
  Housing .................................................................................................................................... 37
  Case management ..................................................................................................................... 44
  Counseling ............................................................................................................................... 50
  Employment and skills training ................................................................................................. 53
  Education and awareness .......................................................................................................... 55
  Other .......................................................................................................................................... 58

Findings 2: Memorable messages, labeling and stigma ................................................................ 62

  Memorable messages: ............................................................................................................... 62

  Stigma and labels ...................................................................................................................... 74

Conclusion ...................................................................................................................................... 80
This study examines how the organization Calltofreedom, located in Sioux Falls South Dakota, works to rehabilitate victims of sex trafficking and how, what this organization offers fits with the needs these victims have. Secondly, this study looks at memorable messages clients of Calltofreedom receive that prevents or encourages them to heal after getting out of a trafficking situation. Sex trafficking is not only an international problem but a home-grown problem in the United States. Awareness about sex trafficking and needs of victims, especially in rural places, is still lacking. With this comes a lack in organizations that can help empower victims. Investigating how Calltofreedom works and how their work fits their clients’ needs is important information for the organization itself and the clients that use this organization. Understanding what memorable messages encourage victims to look for help and start healing is important for services organizations and law enforcement as they are often the first interaction women have to get out of a trafficking situation. Through interviews with staff members, victims, law enforcement and other victim services this study has tried to create a clear picture of what victims need, what is offered and what needs to change to better help sex trafficking victims.
Introduction

Over the past several decades, the problem of human trafficking has received increased public attention due to movies like “Taken” and “Eden”, new legislation, and multiple trainings and seminars for law enforcement and social services staff (Jordan, Patel and Rapp 2013). Human trafficking in the United States (U.S.) encompasses two different offenses: trafficking to the U.S. and trafficking within the U.S. Although both are difficult to measure, recent estimates suggest that between 14,000 to 17,500 or 18,000 to 20,000 women and children are trafficked to the U.S. each year, mostly from Latin America, Asia, and Eastern Europe (State Department 2004). Numbers of women and children at risk of being trafficked within the U.S. lay between 244,000 and 325,000 (Estes and Weiner 2001; Talbot 2011). However, these numbers are estimates and research suggests that the numbers are skewed due to unclear or flawed methodology in data collection (McGaha and Evans 2009). Fedina (2015) examined 49 published books on human trafficking to look at the methodology for data collection and the statistics used. She found that in some of the trusted research from the State Department (2001, 2003, 2004, and 2007), Estes and Weiner (2001) and Bales (1999) the methodology behind how the data was gathered is unclear or non-existed. As these numbers are used as fact in many other studies regarding the extent of human trafficking, the true scope of human trafficking to or within the U.S remains unclear.

The two main types of human trafficking are sex trafficking and labor trafficking. Sex trafficking is a commercial sex act that is encouraged by force, fraud, or coercion or a situation in which the victim is younger than 18 years of age (TVPA 2000). According to the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, sex trafficking operations occur in
very visible situations, such as street prostitution, as well as more underground locations, such as closed brothel systems that operate out of residential homes (Estes and Weiner 2001; Stotts and Ramey 2009). Sex trafficking also takes place in a variety of public and private locations, such as massage parlors, spas and strip clubs. Motels or hotels, cars, and/or tents in or near a field worked by migrant workers are additional places for trafficking (Estes and Weiner 2001; Stotts and Ramey 2009). Labor trafficking is defined as the use of force, fraud, or coercion to encourage an individual into one of many forms of forced labor situations, including involuntary servitude and debt bondage (U.S. Department of State 2005). Involuntary servitude refers to a condition of servitude through one of two types of threats. In the first type, a trafficker threatens to harm an individual, or one or more members of his or her family, if the victim does not provide some form of work. In the second type, the trafficker threatens to report the victim to legal or immigration authorities (U.S. Department of State 2005). A common belief is that women are the only victims of human trafficking, but studies show that children and males are increasingly victimized as the market for cheap labor and labor trafficking grows (Rand 2009; Reid 2010; Zhang 2012). This thesis research will focus on victims of sex trafficking as the even more hidden nature of labor trafficking and limited resources prevents me from finding a way into this population.

A common misconception is that trafficking in women and children for the sex industry is only a problem in countries outside of the United States or that it only happens to people from third world/developing countries. The United States has been less visible as a site for transnational and domestic trafficking in women and children primarily because research on sex trafficking in the United States has been limited (Newton,
Mulcahy, Martin 2008). Research that has been conducted on the topic of sex trafficking in the United States focuses largely on examining the legal and social frameworks of this type of human trafficking and focuses largely on urban settings (Curtis et al. 2008; Smith et al. 2009; Raphael and Ashley 2010; Cole and Sprang 2015). There is little research into sex trafficking in rural areas; especially the Northern Great Plains (Cole and Sprang 2015; Nichols and Heil 2015). Most research on sex trafficking explores the nature, causes, and dynamics of commercial sexual exploitation, but does not research the services and law enforcement resources designed to help victims (Reid 2010). Research into these topics will help social services practitioners, law enforcement professionals, policy makers, and the public understand the complexities of the commercial sexual exploitation of people in the United States and the resources available to help prevent and heal (Rand 2009).

There is a great deal of trafficking within the Northern Great Plains that is largely contributed to vulnerabilities like poverty and homelessness. This is largely due to the high number of Native American reservations, which include the poorest counties in the U.S. Another reason is local events such as the Sturgis Bike Rally in the Black Hills of South Dakota and the Oil Boom in the Bakken Shale in North Dakota (Archbolt 2013; Borer 2015; Nichols and Heil 2015). In an interview with CNBC, Ms. Lazenko, founder of the NGO 4Her in North Dakota, said “The conditions of the oil fields have invited an increase in the reality of trafficking in the Bakken Shale”, (2015). In recent years, federal law enforcement has prosecuted about 50 sex trafficking cases in the state of South Dakota. Three of these cases resulted in several life sentences which are the toughest in the nation (FOX News 2015).
Both the Bakken Shale and the Black Hills have seen increases in population due to the annual Sturgis bike rally in the Black Hills. The oil production in the Bakken Shale resulted in a more permanent population rise, predominantly of young males. These male dominant population raise the demand for sex trafficking because males are the primary customers in the sex trafficking industry, they influence the desired type of females and locations for seeking services (Yen 2008). Male demand has also increased the demand for the number of clean girls or in other words, virgins, which increasingly makes children a target for the sex trafficking industry (Yen 2008). The Skewed male to female ratio, large amounts of money flowing into the area and poor populations around make the communities around these events vulnerable to trafficking with minority women and children of low socioeconomic status being particularly at risk (Wolf, Garza and Smith 2010). Within current research on human sex trafficking, gaps around services for victims and awareness and education remain.

Literature review

Social and legal definitions of trafficking

Human trafficking is, as defined by the United Nations in, Article 3 paragraph (a) of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons defines Trafficking in Persons as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a
minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.

From this definition, the Victim of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act (VTVPA) was formed in 2000 and amended in 2003, 2005, 2008, and 2013, defining the different types of trafficking that are used in most research into human trafficking in the United States (Rand 2009; Talbot 2011; Johnson 2012; Nichols and Heil 2015).

The two most common forms of human trafficking or exploitation of people in the United States are: 1) sex exploitation, defined by the VTVPA (Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act, 2013: p. 6) as “sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age” and 2) forced labor defined by the VTVPA (2013: p. 5) as “the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery.” The VTVPA (2013) states that sex trafficking means the “recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act” (p. 8) and that a commercial sex act is "any sex act on account of which anything of value is given to or received by any person" (p. 7). Other less common exploitations or reasons for trafficking are the removal of organs or smuggling. Smuggling humans differs from trafficking when it involves migrants who have consented to illegal transport across a border. Upon arrival in the country of destination often the involvement of the smuggler ends and the smuggled person is free to go his or her own way. In some cases, smuggling
turns into trafficking when a smuggled person who initially consented, has that consent rendered meaningless by the coercive, deceptive or abusive means used by the trafficker. In this case, when a trafficked person arrives in the destination country, the trafficker continues to control the trafficked person by forcing her or him to labor or perform sexual services (Shigekane 2007; UNOCD Trafficking Report 2014).

The United States is most often seen as a transit or destination state for human trafficking (Rand 2009; Kotrla 2010; Talbot 2011). It is surprising that more U.S. citizens are victims of sex trafficking than are foreign nationals (Hughes 2007; Kotrla 2010). The Department of Justice (DOJ) statistics show that the trafficking of American citizens within the United States counts for about 83 percent of all human trafficking between 2008 and 2010 (Johnson 2012). Estimates of women and children trafficked into the US each year range from 50,000 (US Department of State 2002) to between 14,500 and 17,500 (US Government Accountability Office 2006). These numbers are estimates therefore accurate counts of domestic sex trafficking victims are not available due to the hidden nature of the population, lack of tracking, misidentification, plea agreements or declined prosecution, as well as differences in definition of what trafficking is (Jordan, Patel and Rapp 2013). Davis (2009), Rand (2009) and Tallbot (2011) note that variations in estimates is expected due to challenges related to conducting research and gathering reliable data on such a vulnerable and hidden population. Not much empirical data is being used in current human trafficking research. The figures used by the DOJ, UNOCD and the State Department are not based on empirical data and are often based on other organizations estimates (Davis 2009; Rand 2009; Tallbot 2011).
In most trafficking cases, women and girls become victims of human trafficking through of the coercion of someone acting like a friend or boyfriend (Contreras, Kallivayalil and Herman 2017). Additionally, women and girls being sold by parents or other family members is also common, especially in rural communities (Johnson 2012). Most of the women and girls that become victims of human trafficking are vulnerable due to poverty, homelessness, sexual or physical abuse in the past, and substance abuse issues (Davis 2009; Tallbot 2011; Johnson 2012). Traffickers, also called pimps, know to look for these vulnerabilities and therefore scope out places like a mall, a bus station or other places where runaway youth would go. They often use recruiters to spy out needy youth by frequenting their typical locations and control most prostituted girls in their area (Reid 2016). At first, sex traffickers or pimps may present themselves as loving and compassionate boyfriends who offer to help victims escape from an abusive home life or the streets where living conditions are harsh and unsafe (Parker and Skrmetti 2013; Anderson et al. 2014). In the case of Native American/American Indian girls, generational trauma often plays a big role in the way these women and girls become victims (Johnson 2012). Victimization of American Indian women has been an issue dating back to colonialization. During the colonization of the U.S., American Indian women experienced high levels of sexual assault, prostitution, physical abuse, and racist verbal abuse (Koepplin and Pierce 2009; Johnson 2012). After colonialization, a period of forced assimilation occurred in which American Indian children were put into boarding schools off the reservations to assimilate to white culture. At these boarding schools, students often endured physical and sexual abuse (Koepplin and Pierce 2009; Reid 2012; Johnson 2012). Due to reservations being placed in parts of the U.S. that are
far away from resources, lack transportation and jobs and don’t have good farmland, many American Indians still live in poverty. This and a long history of abuse accounts for higher rates of homelessness and chronic physical and mental health issues. This again puts Native Americans and American Indians at higher risk of exposure to traumatic events and violent victimizations (Reid 2012). This, in turn creates continued vulnerability to prostitution and trafficking among American Indian women and children because of increasing economic stress and decreasing abilities to resist predators. Another vulnerability to trafficking is past sexual abuse and trauma (Reid 2012; Contreras, Kallivayalil and Herman 2017). The vast majority of prostituted women were sexually assaulted as children, usually by multiple perpetrators, and were re-victimized as adults in prostitution/trafficking situations as they experienced being hunted, dominated, harassed, assaulted, beaten, and sometimes murdered by costumers, pimps, and traffickers (Farley et al. 2016).

LGBTQ Youth

Young people have been identified as being uniquely vulnerable to trafficking due to being in foster care, homelessness, previous sexual trauma or substance abuse issues (Middleton et al. 2018). One reason for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transgender and Queer (LGBTQ) youth being especially vulnerable is that they exist outside of societal norms and are often misidentified as victims, abused, criminalized, incarcerated, or re-victimized (Xian, Chock and Dwiggins 2017). As mentioned above, traffickers take advantage of these vulnerabilities by posing as a friend, a lover or a care taker. Research has explored not only the experiences of LGBTQ youth recruited by a third-party like a boyfriend, family member or other exploiters, but also the experience of homeless youth who become involved in commercial sex without a specific exploiter or
pimp. Some of these homeless young people exchange sex for basic needs like drugs, alcohol or a place to stay, this is also known as survival sex (Dank et al. 2015; Xian, Chock and Dwiggins 2017). These youths often have difficulty obtaining housing, services, food, and safety. Studies have shown that homeless youth often state that they entered the commercial sex market after being approached by a potential customer on the street, while an even greater number of girls and boys report that they were introduced into the commercial sexual economy through friends (Dank et al. 2015).

Approximately 40 percent of runaway and homeless youth identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, or queer (LGBTQ) (Dank et al. 2015). LGBTQ youth make up a disproportionate amount of run away and homeless youth because of race and gender-based job discrimination, discrimination from families, police, and social services, all of which making their economic and social choices limited or non-existent. These economic difficulties related to housing and the lack of available employment and health care options are among the predominant factors driving LGBTQ youths to survival sex (Martinez and Kelle 2014). Because of the even more hidden nature of trafficking of LGBTQ youth, LGBTQ sex trafficking is commonly overlooked and rarely reported by local and national governments. LGBTQ individuals are often prevented from accessing the outside world due to stigma, discrimination and shame around being a member of the LGBTQ community as well as engaging in same-sex commercial sex acts or being trafficked. As a result, LGBT individuals fall into political and social traps that require focused attention from legal and health professionals (Martinez and Kelle 2014).

Violence Against Women Act (VAWA)

The Violence Against Women Act (VAWA) was implemented in 1994 and was the first bipartisan piece of legislation to combat intimate partner violence. It was
intended to change attitudes and create awareness for domestic violence, improve services for victims and change the way law enforcement responds to Intimate Partner Violence and other sex crimes. VAWA was revised several times over the years to include more comprehensive programs (Conyers 2007). To ensure that VAWA was inclusive of diverse populations, VAWA included special protections for immigrants and underserved populations (Burt et al. 2001). In 2000, VAWA was reauthorized and passed together with the Victims of Trafficking Protection Act. It included enhanced federal domestic violence and stalking penalties. The reauthorization also included protections and programs for victims of abuse who are foreign nationals, and disabled and elderly women (Orloff and Kaguyutan 2002). These programs include grant programs to prevent elder abuse, providing special visa for immigrants who were trafficked and programs to provide support for women with disabilities (Orloff and Kaguyutan 2002).

In 2005, the VAWA reauthorization included enhanced penalties for repeat stalking and enhanced protections for battered and/or trafficked foreign nationals, created programs for sexual assault victims and American Indian victims of domestic violence and related crimes. Lastly it created programs designed to improve the public health response to domestic violence. New VAWA authorizations in 2013 included an amendment and authorized appropriations for the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, enhanced measures to combat trafficking in persons, and amended some VAWA grant purpose areas to include sex trafficking. VAWA 2013 created services for LGBTQ victims of domestic violence for the first time. It created legislation about their rights and explicitly included LGBTQ victims in two key VAWA grant programs. VAWA now contains a nondiscrimination clause that prohibits LGBTQ individuals from being turned
away from shelters or other VAWA funded programs on the basis of sexual orientation or gender identity (Modi, Palmer and Armstrong 2014). It also gave Native American tribes authority to enforce domestic violence laws and related crimes against non-Native individuals. This is an especially important change because studies have shown that Native American women are twice as likely to experience sexual assault as other women and that non-Native men are responsible for 70 percent of the victimization perpetrated against Native women (Ortega and Busch-Armendariz 2013). The confusion over jurisdictional responsibility, tribal law enforcement or the federal systems when the perpetrator is non-Native has resulted in a free pass for perpetrators to rape, assault and murder women on the reservation without any consequences (Conyers 2007; Sacco 2014; Murshid and Bowen 2018).

Places of trafficking
Most of the studies into human trafficking have researched urban places like Los Angeles, Chicago, Atlanta, Las Vegas and Minneapolis (Estes and Weiner 2001; Stevens and Bales 2005; Rand 2009; Reid 2010; Hounmenou 2012; Nicolson and Heil 2015). Nicholson and Heil (2015) found that advertisements on backpage.com or craigslist, for the same victims would appear in multiple cities at different points in time. Social service providers and the federal prosecutors described this phenomenon as running the circuit. Advertising the same victims in multiple places on different days so it is less likely for the trafficker to get caught. Nicolson and Heil (2015) also found that movement from state to state was described as a concern by the police, the federal prosecutor, social service providers, legal advocates, and attorneys because it makes it difficult to identify, charge, and prosecute such cases (Talbot 2011). The buying and selling of people has become easier with the rise of mass media. The internet and social media are believed to
be the single greatest facilitator driving the growth of pimping and sex trafficking (Polaris Project 2011). Prostitution moving away from the streets is making it more difficult to find victims. Massage parlors, bars, campgrounds and motels are now often used as “brothels” (Reid 2010).

Few studies have looked at human trafficking in rural communities (Johnson 2012; Nicolson and Heil 2015). Studies on rural communities mostly focus on the trafficking of Native American/American Indian women and girls (Johnson 2012; Nicolson and Heil 2015). Other studies have found that human trafficking in rural and urban settings is different because of the lack of attention trafficking gets in rural communities. Collection of data on trafficking is more limited in rural communities because individuals perceive the problem to be a big city or metropolitan issue (Cole and Sprang 2015; Perkins and Ruiz 2017). Social service providers and law enforcement officers in rural communities are less likely to be trained in recognizing signs of human trafficking, and to distinguish between human trafficking victims and prostitutes, compared to professionals in bigger cities (Cole and Sprang 2015; Perkins and Ruiz 2017). These studies also found that geographical dispersal of resources contributes to trafficking victims going undetected or can’t get to resources when they are situations that make them vulnerable for trafficking like being homeless, past sexual trauma, mental illness or substance abuse.

Events related to trafficking in South Dakota

Large male-dominated events attract human trafficking (Reid 2010). Examples of this are the Super Bowl, hunting season and the Sturgis motorcycle rally (Borer 2015). Even military bases have been identified as places for increased human trafficking (Davis 2006). Poverty, the presence of an adult prostitution market, and the presence of large
numbers of transient men, like tourists, truckers, or military personnel are community circumstances that inflate a woman’s or girl’s risk for entrapment into prostitution (Estes and Weiner 2001, 2005).

There are several events in the Dakotas that contribute to sex trafficking. First, the oil development in the Bakken region in North Dakota. The population of several towns in this region grew rapidly. This rapid population growth has created problems with housing, schools, and roads in communities across the region (Archbold 2013). As the workforce for the oilfield is predominantly male, the gender divide in these towns becomes skewed. With the rapid growth of a single male population flushed with money, the demand for sex workers has grown and created a new market for pimps to traffic women. These trafficking routes create problems in the surrounding states, including South Dakota.

Second, the Sturgis motorcycle rally in Sturgis, South Dakota greatly contributes to sex trafficking in the region (Talbot 2010). Talbot (2010) made observations while working as a volunteer for a local domestic violence center and a ministry that provides services to trafficked women, in the summer of 2010 during the rally. The director of a shelter made her aware of women getting left behind on the campgrounds and looking for shelter at churches or local police stations, during the Sturgis rally every year. During this 2010 summer internship, Talbot spoke to some women who complained about long hours and lower pay than was promised. These women were watched closely by a man and after the conversation with Talbot were questioned about the conversation. One of the women was not seen working again during the rally (2010). Some of the girls she spoke to looked under aged. Law enforcement has been making many arrests at the Sturgis bike

South Dakota tier ranking

The Polaris Project is an organization that tracks and researches human trafficking around the world. The Polaris Project is a global leader in the fight to eliminate human trafficking. Polaris tries to disrupt human trafficking networks all over the world that rob human beings of their lives and their freedom. Their inclusive model puts victims of trafficking at the center of their projects by helping survivors of trafficking restore their freedom, preventing others from becoming victims and combining data and technology to peruse traffickers wherever they operate (Polaris project). The tier system of the Polaris project ranks all U.S. states on ten types of laws.

The types of laws tracked include: (1) sex trafficking; (2) labor trafficking; (3a) asset forfeiture for trafficking offenses, (3b) investigative tools such as including human trafficking in the state racketeering statute or authorization of interception of communications during investigations into trafficking; (4a) training for law enforcement, (4b) development of a task force; (5) lower burden of proof for the prosecution of child sex trafficking offenses; (6) posting information about a human trafficking hotline; (7) providing safe harbor to minor victims of trafficking; (8) victim assistance plans or services; (9) a civil remedy for human trafficking victims; and (10) vacating convictions (Polaris Project 2014).

In 2013, South Dakota had minimal legislation criminalizing sex trafficking according to the Polaris project (2013). They stated, South Dakota has "not made minimal efforts to
enact a basic legal framework to combat human trafficking and should actively work to improve laws, especially those that protect victims” (2013). Since then, South Dakota legislators have made small gains by passing laws criminalizing sex and labor trafficking as well as laws for victim’s assistance. Despite recent laws (detailed in the following section), South Dakota is still lacking in how it deals with sex trafficking because the state does not have mandated training in sex trafficking for all law enforcement, provide assistance to victims, vacate convictions for sex trafficking, or have a posted hotline number for victims (Polaris project 2014). Sioux Falls police chief, Doug Barthel and Attorney General Marty Jackley do not agree with the low ranking of the Polaris Project. They believe that the new laws and increased law enforcement training and sting operations proves that South Dakota is treating trafficking seriously (Argus Leader 2014).

Since 2009, South Dakota law enforcement has been involved in the investigation and prosecution of 23 sex trafficking cases (Noem 2014) but have been slow to pass laws against forced labor and involuntary sex work.

South Dakota law changes

U.S. Attorney Brendan Johnson says the debate about whether or not trafficking is an issue in South Dakota is over. He recognizes that human trafficking exists in South Dakota and will make it the U.S. Attorney’s office first priority (Rapid City Journal 2013). In 2011, South Dakota only had two points on the Polaris Project ten-point tier ranking system described above. The only category South Dakota got points for was: laws that prohibit sex and labor trafficking. These laws were:

“§ 22-49-1. Human trafficking prohibited No person may recruit, harbor, transport, provide, or obtain, by any means, another person knowing that force,
fraud, or coercion will be used to cause the person to engage in prostitution, forced labor, or involuntary servitude; § 22-49-2. First degree human trafficking; § 22-49-3. Second degree human trafficking.”

New laws incorporated in the 2014 ranking by the Polaris project include asset forfeiture for human trafficking which allows confiscation by the state of all assets made by criminal activity and access to civil damages laws, which means damages are offset by an award, typically of money, to be paid to a person as compensation for loss or injury. South Dakota has one law on victim’s assistance in 2014. In this tier South Dakota has one point for the access to civil damages law.

“§ 22-24A-15. Forfeiture of Certain Property Interests. Any person who is convicted of an offense shall forfeit to the state the person's interest in contraband and no property right exists in them. Any property described in subdivision (1) of this section shall be deemed contraband and shall be summarily forfeited to the state. Any other property seized and forfeited shall be used to reimburse the actual costs of the criminal investigation and prosecution. Any amount over and above the amount necessary to reimburse for the investigation and prosecution shall be used to satisfy any civil judgments received by victims. All remaining proceeds from the sale of any forfeited property shall be paid into the South Dakota internet crimes against children fund.”

Congresswomen Kristi Noem of South Dakota has helped pass several federal bills against human trafficking in 2014 and 2015 which affect South Dakota law as well at federal law. These bills include:
• **H.R. 4225, Stop Advertising Victims of Exploitation (SAVE) Act**

H.R. 4225 is designed to close Internet marketplaces, like Backpage.com, that host advertisements for the commercial exploitation of minors. More specifically, it allows prosecutors to charge websites with a federal crime if they knowingly advertise sex with minors.

• **H.R. 2805, End Sex Trafficking Act – Cosponsored by Rep. Noem**

Many of today’s federal laws equip prosecutors with the tools they need to go after traffickers but this law is not clear on the fact of people who solicit the services of trafficking services fall under this federal law as well. H.R. 2805 clarifies the law so there is and will continue to be no question about whether the federal law applies to those who solicit underage kids.

• **H.R.3610, Stop Exploitation through Sex Trafficking Act – Cosponsored by Rep. Noem**

H.R. 3610 establishes Safe Harbor laws nationwide, which requires that minors engaged in prostitution are treated as trafficking victims, not criminals. In addition, the bill:

  - Establishes a National Human Trafficking Hotline.
  - Establishes a national strategy to combat human trafficking and enhances law enforcement coordination among government agencies.

• **H.R. 4058, Preventing Sex Trafficking and Improving Opportunities for Youth in Foster Care Act – Cosponsored by Rep. Noem**

H.R. 4058 works to improve the way states monitor and share information for children in foster care. It encourages foster parents to make more day-to-day
decisions for youth in their care and encourages states to do more to move kids out of foster care and into an adoptive home or permanent living situation.

- **H.R. 3530, Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act – Cosponsored by Rep. Noem**

H.R. 3530 creates a fund for trafficking victims, improves task forces to combat human trafficking and increases penalties for human trafficking.

The current tier ranking of the Polaris project does not reflect the addition of these new laws. This legislation would influence the ranking of South Dakota as South Dakota now includes laws on a trafficking hotline, victim’s assistance, and safe harbors for victims. These bills would fall into categories five to eight in the Polaris project tier ranking.

Former U.S. attorney Brendan Johnson of South Dakota has also put a trafficking task force into place in 2013. So far, this taskforce has aided in arresting and prosecuting 23 cases of trafficking since 2009. Hard numbers are difficult to find because sex trafficking is not easy to prove and prosecute (Reid 2010). There are some examples of cases from the past years that were prosecuted and resulted in a guilty verdict:

- **United States Attorney Brendan V. Johnson announced that Mohammed Sharif Alaboudi, age 45, of Sioux Falls, South Dakota, was found guilty of four counts of sex trafficking, including sex trafficking by force and sex trafficking of a child.** The guilty verdicts followed a four-day federal jury trial in Sioux Falls. Each of the four counts carries a maximum prison term of life. Three counts carry mandatory minimum prison terms of 15 years (FBI 2013).

- **United States Attorney Brendan V. Johnson announced that nine men have been arrested and federally indicted as a result of a sex trafficking undercover operation**
conducted during the 2013 Sturgis Motorcycle Rally, which ended August 11. All nine men were indicted for commercial sex trafficking (FBI 2013)

- United States Attorney Brendan V. Johnson announced that Jerry Lane Golliher, age 32, of Rapid City, South Dakota, was found guilty of Commercial Sex Trafficking following a two-day federal jury trial held in U.S. District Court in Rapid City. The guilty verdict was returned on October 1, 2014 (FBI 2014)

- United States Attorney Brendan V. Johnson announced that five men have been arrested and federally indicted as a result of a sex trafficking undercover operation conducted during the 2014 Sturgis Motorcycle Rally, which ended August 9, 2014. All five men were indicted for Commercial Sex Trafficking and all are from out-of-state (FBI 2014).

Barriers in awareness, response and services
Even though sex trafficking has received increased attention over the years there is still a lack of awareness and response to sex trafficking in many areas (Jordan, Patel and Rapp 2013). Hounmenou (2012) examined the awareness of service providers about human trafficking and the policies in place to respond to this problem on the federal and state level. This study found that the awareness about domestic trafficking was limited and that knowledge about state and federal policies regarding trafficking was low. Half of the services providers questioned in this study had no training on how to identify or support victims of trafficking and lack of funding for services for trafficking victims was mentioned as the number one challenge to support services. A study by Reid (2010) had similar findings. This study explored the identification of Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking victims and their access to crime victim services. Findings suggest professionals’ lack of awareness or understanding of domestic minor sex trafficking
which results in failure to identify victims. This misidentification results in only a few victims accessing services and therefore victim centered services and protocols are scares. Tallbot (2011) looked at gaps in knowledge about victim needs and services in a rural community in South Dakota. She found that loss of Christian values, disrupted family structures and society’s access to the internet are some of the forces contributing to increased trafficking in her community. These forces paired with the Sturgis bike rally and hunting season and the lack of services makes trafficking survivors an underserved population. Koepplin and Pierce (2009) specifically looked into the sexual exploitation of Native American women and girls. They looked at the needs, how they got into a trafficking situation and vulnerabilities and risk factors. They found that the needs these women have are not adequately addressed by service organizations or law enforcement. All the above-mentioned studies also found that specific barriers for victim services included lack of training in identifying sex trafficking victims, the hidden nature of sex crimes, the inability or unwillingness of victims to self-identify, and the lack of systematic data tracking of sex trafficking victims.

Another problem to identify victims of trafficking is inconsistent state laws that define victims differently which means most cases have to go to the federal court system to get any attention. The result is that trafficking victims may be seen as victims in some states and therefore not responsible for their prostitution offenses while other states may view sex trafficking victims as offenders and prosecute them for prostitution. Perdue et al. (2012) found that Ohio women were convicted of prostitution because the definition of trafficking only applies to victims who are minors. None of the women in this study could be legally defined as victims of trafficking because they were over the age of
eighteen and involved in prostitution through means of “force,” “fraud,” or “coercion” that could not be proven at the time of their arrest. The women were instead being prostituted because of drug habits, poverty, and the outcomes of earlier trauma which are not considered to be force, fraud or coercion.

Purpose statement
There has not been a lot of research conducted in the Midwest region of the U.S. and the state of South Dakota is especially under-researched in terms of human trafficking (Nicolson and Heil 2015). South Dakota is a rural state and has nine Native American reservation within its borders. While reservations will not be the focus of this study, they do have a large impact as Native American women are increasingly victimized in this region (Johnson 2012). In South Dakota human trafficking has gotten more attention over the past few years (Borer 2015). There are growing numbers of trafficking victims being identified in South Dakota at the Sturgis motorbike rally, at the start of hunting season or in passing through to other states (Talbot 2011; Borer 2015). This paper will look at the challenges and successes of the sex trafficking service organization Calltofreedom in South Dakota. Of interest to the researcher is how the organization works, the types of services that are offered or referred, and how well these services fit the needs of the victims/clients. A secondary purpose of this research is, to understand why some victims seek help and some do not. Memorable messages and labeling theory will help to understand how people change their actions to messages they receive or labels they get given and how this service organization works to help victims of sex trafficking get back into society.
Theoretical framework
The current study will use two theoretical perspectives to analyze CalltoFreedom’s services and clients’ experiences using those services. The two theories that are explored are labeling theory and memorable messages theory.

Labeling theory

Labeling theory came forth from the idea of the social construction of reality, which is central to the field of sociology and is linked to the symbolic interactionist perspective. The symbolic interactionist tradition of the “looking glass self” (Cooley 1902), or the “reflexive self” (Mead 1934), mean that a person will see the self in a way that reflects the views of others and therefore start to act in a way consistent with these views. Lemert (1951) showed that secondary deviance can be created when normal exploratory behavior shown by a child or adolescent is labeled as “deviant” by society. Therefore, a child who engages in these activities is labeled as a delinquent by society. Labeling theory is a theory used in criminology and criminal justice to explain that being labeled as a “deviant” leads a person to show deviant behavior. Howard Becker (1963), was one of the first to use labeling theory in his research into the sociology of deviance. He found that there is nothing inherently deviant about acts people preform, but that society has marked or labeled particular acts as “deviant” and that deviants who face labels must adapt to the consequences that come with the labeling. Definitions of what is considered criminal are established by people in power through the formulation of laws and the interpretation of those laws by law enforcement, the courts, and correctional institutions. Therefore, deviance is not a set of character traits a person has or does not have, but a process of interactions and the intersection between deviants and non-deviants.
and how criminal activity is being interpreted, which can be different across race, class and gender (Becker 1973). He also found that the general impact the deviant label has on further embedding the individual into deviant social groups. Deviant groups represent a source of social support in which deviant activities are accepted. Moreover, deviant groups often provide social shelter from those who react negatively toward the deviant status. The labeled person is thus increasingly likely to become involved in social groups that consist of social deviants and unconventional others. Disintegrative shaming whereby an individual’s whole self is seen as bad, rather than a specific action, in combination with social rejection, is likely to lead to association with deviant peers and to delinquent and criminal behavior (Becker 1973).

Feiring, Miller-Johnson and Cleland (2007) used labeling theory to look at childhood sexual abuse leading to deviancy. A dominant theory in the child sexual abuse literature proposes that processes related to stigmatization are important for understanding the adjustment of victims. As originally hypothesized by Finkelhor and Browne (1985), stigmatization means negative feelings and thoughts about the self as bad and blameworthy. Stigmatization in this view was expected to lead victims, who saw themselves as damaged goods, to associate with others viewed as deviant and through such associations to become involved in delinquent or criminal behaviors. Mossy (2008) and Ray and Dollar (2014) looked at the impact of self-labeling among youth diagnosed with mental disorders. He found that adolescents reporting more exposure to social discrimination and devaluation because mental health issues were more inclined to self-label. Stigmatizing responses on the part of others can be conceptualized as facilitating self-labeling. The stigma becomes the way a person views or labels themselves which
may lead to feelings of social isolation, resentment and negative feelings toward others. Asencio and Burk (2011) explained that labels can affect people’s identities. They looked at how the context of incarceration due to institutional norm and restrictions, presents a unique power differential in which inmates may be more subject to change the identity standard in accordance with the views of others. This could be like a trafficking victim assimilating to the view of the trafficker due to isolation and pressure from deviant peers.

This study will use labeling theory to understand how labeling and stigmatization prevents trafficked women from coming forward and look for help. Secondly, this theory will give me an understanding of how deviant labels like “criminal” or “prostitute” prevent these women from using services they need to integrate into the community due to criminal records they have been obtained during their trafficking past.

Memorable messages

In a day, each person receives hundreds of verbal messages in face to face communication with other people. Most of these messages are received, processed, responded to and forgotten. However, there are a few messages that are remembered for a long time and that people see as having a major influence on their life (Knapp et al. 1981). A distinguishing factor between memorable messages and the thousands of other messages that are received each day is that individuals can precisely recall the memorable message word-for-word (Stohl 1986). Stohl’s (1986) study also found that most memorable messages have a specific structure, form and nature of context. She looked at messages that were transmitted in an organizational setting and found that these message help communications within an organization. Memorable messages have been found to
be stimulants for behavior change in that they often contain advice that leads to the self-assessment of personal behavior that exceeds or falls below personal standards (Smith et al. 2001). The influence of memorable messages has been studied in a range of circumstances. Nazione et al. (2011) looked at how memorable messages help students navigate college life. She found that majority of the students’ reported memorable messages were academic. Students also reported that they changed their behavior by studying more or taking certain classes, after recalling this message. Keeley (2004) looked at memorable messages within faith and spirituality. Smith et al. (2009), found that memorable messages can promote a healthy lifestyle and prevention for breast cancer. They found that individuals who had a personal, friend or relative experience with breast cancer were significantly more likely to recall memorable messages about providing facts, advice and hope, than other respondents. Another study by Smith et al. (2010) found that messages that showed fear or anger were significantly more likely to be associated with detection of breast cancer behaviors like self-examination, whereas messages that showed relief were significantly less likely to be associated with detection behaviors than messages that did not show these emotions.

The study closest to this research is what kind of memorable messages women on parole receive from their probation or parole officers. This study by Cornacchione et al. (2016) found that memorable messages present themselves in three different situations. First, people recalled memorable messages when doing something that surpasses their goals or values of which they are proud, such as a former trafficking victim getting a job or getting sober. Second, memorable messages were recalled stopping people from engaging in behavior that could lead them to experience feelings of regret, for instance a
trafficking victim remembering her case managers word when feeling she wants to go back into prostitution. Lastly, memorable messages were recalled when a new behavior could cause the discrepancy between one’s ideal and actual self to widen because the action is something the person is not proud of and regrets. For example, if a woman relapses, she may recall a memorable message from her case manager that helps her behave in a way that makes her avoid places where she may be tempted to use drugs. The focus of this study was to understand the way that interpersonal level messages sent by important others such as a parole or probation officer, are used by people to assess their own behaviors (Chaffee and Berger 1987).

I will use memorable messages theory to understand if victims of trafficking can recall a specific message that made them look or not look for help out of their trafficking situation. I want to identify specific messages and their source. Secondly, I want to look at what kind of memorable messages services providers and law enforcement officers give victims of trafficking and how the try and get their message across. This might be an important way in the future to create a more supportive and trusted environment for trafficking victims to come forward and be able to get the services they need.
Research methods
Research site
The research site centers around CalltoFreedom, an organization in Sioux Falls, South Dakota. CalltoFreedom is a faith-based organization that provides supportive services for victims and survivors of human trafficking and sexual exploitation. By creating a strong network of frontline providers who offer services like safe housing, mental health counseling, medical assistance, chemical dependency, and transportation. They serve victims and survivors in Sioux Falls and the surrounding areas.

The directive of Calltofreedom is to provide a safe place for victims and survivors of human trafficking and those who are at risk. Their after-care case management services include: counseling, life-coaching, and trauma management. CalltoFreedom, navigates a healthy path for victims and survivors of human trafficking and sexual exploitation

Sampling
Convenient sampling was used to conduct interviews with the staff members of this organization and with six women/victims. Interviews with other organizations, that were of value to this research, were conducted at different locations at different organizations like local law enforcement office, mental health organization and shelters. Lastly, due to organizations being far away or on participants request three interviews were conducted by phone.

Four groups of participants were interviewed:
1. CalltoFreedom staff. Two staff members participated in this research. Both were
interviewed at the organization’s office. Both interviews lasted between an hour and an hour and a half.

2. Victims of human trafficking receiving services from the organization. A staff member/gate keeper provided information to victims/clients receiving services through their organization. Six clients participated and all were interviewed at the CalltoFreedom offices. Each participant received $50 compensation for their time regardless of finishing the interview. All interviews lasted between 45 minutes and an hour and a half.

3. Four Law enforcement officers within three different bureaus were interviewed. The interviews were conducted at the offices of these officers or via phone. All law enforcement officers were asked about their training, experiences in detecting human trafficking, departmental needs, and collaboration among departments and other organizations. Because law enforcement officers are often the first contact between victims and service organizations, their knowledge about training and collaboration is very valuable to this research. All interview took between 45 minutes and hour and a half.

4. Members of four organizations that work with CalltoFreedom participated in this research. Interviews were conducted with a counselor at a counseling center in Sioux falls, the director of an organization that helps educate the community, writes legislation and grants for Calltofreedom. Another interview was conducted with a case manager at a local domestic abuse shelter that provides shelter for victims and survivors of human trafficking. Lastly, a prosecutor with the United States Attorney’s office gave his view on
prosecuting traffickers and buyers of sex with minors. All these interviews lasted between 45 minutes and an hour and a half.

The final sample size consists of eighteen participants. Table 1 presents the sampling breakdown. The type of questions differed for each group of participants but all included question about gaps in services and memorable message theory. This will include questions about, what message did organization give to their clients to make them stay in the program or what message stuck with the victims/clients that made them want to get out of the life. Interviews were recorded on a voice recorder and transcribed into a protected file on a password protected laptop. Incorporating professionals from different organization helped triangulate the data and understand what the rehabilitation of sex trafficking victims looks like and what the victims/clients think of the help they get.

Table 1: Research sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID number</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Estimated Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom Client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Native American</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom Client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Native American</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom Client</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Native American</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom Staff Member</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>CalltoFreedom Staff Member</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Family member</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Victim Witness Assistant</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Race</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Victim Witness Assistant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Computer forensic examiner</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Law enforcement officer</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Prosecutor</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Counselor</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Staff member domestic abuse shelter</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Staff member Domestic violence and Sexual assault service organization</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Staff member health care organization</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data collection

The data was collected in three forms. First, interviews were conducted with sixteen participants in the above categories. Second, data was collected at a one day “Human Trafficking in South Dakota” conference in Pierre. This conference was geared towards local law enforcement and service organization focusing on human trafficking.

The conference had information on both sex and labor trafficking, but the main focus was sex trafficking. Talks were given by the South Dakota States Attorney, law enforcement involved in sting operations during the Sturgis bike rally, and a computer forensic examiner who works internet crimes against children. I gathered information about what sex trafficking looks like in the state of South Dakota, how law enforcement is responding to the problem and learned some specific details about some of the trafficking cases in the state. People who attended this conference were manly different law
enforcement organizations and people from services organizations. I was the only student to ever attend this conference according to the organizer. The information I got from the conference validated the information I had garnered in my own research and gave me the opportunity to connect with potential participants for interviews. Third, I went to two monthly lunches hosted by Calltofreedom. At these lunches presentations were given by staff members of Calltofreedom about how to recognize signs of trafficking and what the organization does to heal and prevent. Through these lunches more information was obtained about the organization and gave me the opportunity to network with other services organizations.

Analysis

After transcribing, member checking was used to increase the validity of this research and to build trust with the participants. Transcriptions were sent out to each participant to ensure accuracy and to give the participant an opportunity to take out or reword anything they said. None of the participants had any changes to make or anything to add.

Eighteen audio recordings were transcribed, formatted into a Microsoft Word document, and then put into NVivo software for qualitative data analysis. Coding was performed around successes and challenges of Calltofreedom, the organizations they work with and law enforcement. Secondly, the data was analyzed for labels and memorable messages that prevented clients of Calltofreedom from seeking help, encouraged them to stay in the program at Calltofreedom or are used by service organization to motivate clients. Open grounded coding was preformed to create categories by developing and reworking the data as well as having categories prepared
beforehand out of the theoretical framework. Transcripts were examined to identify reoccurring concepts, phrases, and themes. Intercoder reliability was met by discussing and agreeing upon the categories in the first and second round of coding. Once the categories were agreed upon, I returned to the data and coded all 18 transcripts for those categories.
Findings 1: Successes and challenges regarding Calltofreedom

The findings in this chapter are presented in two steps. First, it will address the needs trafficking victims in general present with and how these needs are similar to the victims needs in this study. Second, a critical description of each specific need and why they are important for the successful rehabilitation of trafficking victims is given. With each specific need comes a description of how Calltofreedom has addressed or not addressed the need according to the victims participating in this study will be given.

Needs

Victims of human trafficking trying to reintegrate in society and leave a life of being trafficked behind them, have complex individualized needs. No one person is the same or has the same needs, so there is not one fixed program to fit everybody. Identifying each individual’s needs and addressing these needs is Calltofreedom’s primary goal. More and more trafficking-specific organizations have developed over the past ten years. One of the largest, The Coalition to Abolish Slavery and Trafficking (CAST) in Los Angeles, was the first organization to develop an institutional expertise to anticipate challenges faced by survivors of trafficking as they prepare to reintegrate into communities in Southern California (Shigekane 2007). To promote self-sufficiency and to increase the self-esteem of their clients CAST used the empowerment model for rehabilitating trafficking survivors. This model focusses on services such as legal, housing, and employment assistance to empower survivors to take back control over their lives and make informed decisions about it (Shigekane 2007).

Due to the traumatic and long-term nature of human trafficking, survivors may lack the ability to live independently in the community, making them and their children
vulnerable to homelessness or a return to victimization (Dewan 2011). One study reported an average of six attempts to leave their abusers among eighty-four survivors of trafficking (Nail 2015). Survivors cited financial dependence on the abusers and an inability to maintain a job or a house as the main reasons for their eventual return (Shigekane 2007; Dewan 2011; Nail 2015).

And that there are some people go back to trafficking is because they don’t have some of these things provided and so I just think that they want to get out of it but so many times they don’t have the tools and so providing tools as much as is possible helps them be able to actually believe that they can. I think it, for most who have been heavily involved over really long periods of time, is definitely a long struggle. But I think there are other who it is not quite as tough for but without the tools. And I can still understand why some of them, it is hard to, when they are making 8 to 9 bucks and hour when they know what they can make, I don’t know, I’d be shocked if any of the numbers I don’t think we know of more than a couple that have actually go back into trafficking but I can see prostitution when they are up against the wall with the kinds of bills and stuff they have (Staff member Calltofreedom).

Calltofreedom offers long term care to their clients and provides them with the tools they need to become independent citizens.

Keeping in mind the complexity of needs of human trafficking victims, advocates now place a greater emphasis on the development of longer term support and advocacy services. This emphasis focuses on longer term services that include budgeting and
financial management, parenting skills, day care access and childcare, counseling for survivors, support for children who have experienced or witnessed abuse, transitional and affordable housing, and employment assistance including job referrals, job readiness programs, and interview skills (Nail 2015). Studies by Dewan (2011), Nail (2015) and Hankle et al. (2016) of survivors and their advocates have identified these types of services as necessary to empower a survivor to live independently and to minimize the risk of her becoming revictimized.

In a study by Clawson, Dutch and Cummings (2006) service providers were asked about the special needs of persons who have been trafficked, they stated that the services needed most were housing/shelter (65%) followed by medical services (39%), counseling/support groups (27%), advocacy services (26%), legal services (26%), food (26%), social service coordination (24%), mental health services (23%), and clothing (18%). The six clients of Calltofreedom who participated in this research were asked what their needs were when they first came to Calltofreedom. Two staff members of Calltofreedom were also asked what needs they identified for their clients. The needs both groups mentioned and the frequencies they were mentioned in are in table one. The needs the clients and staff of Calltofreedom identified are very similar to the needs in the study by Clawson, Dutch and Cummings (2006) which shows some of the needs trafficking victims have are the same in different places. Secondly, the clients of Calltofreedom were asked how Calltofreedom has addressed or not addressed these needs. Table 1 shows a list of the needs most often mentioned and the frequency of which they were mentioned. Each need and how it was addressed is further discussed in this chapter.
Table 2: Trafficking victims needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Need</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>“None of the half way houses would take me; I was at the homeless shelter; 4 months I was living in my car.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counseling</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>“I have never seen a counselor in my life; never worked with a victim who didn't have PTSD”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>“Help me find a job; When I first came I needed a job; We don’t have decent jobs”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finances</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>“They helped pay my rent”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills training</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>“Helped me with interview skills; I want to learn budgeting.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>“They actually picked me up and drove me; I don’t have a car yet.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chemical dependency</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>“A lot more substance abuse concerns because of trauma; Serious drug problem.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child care</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>“Gaps in the community for evening and weekend childcare.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Group) Activities</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>“Cause I had all this time on my hand and I was driving myself crazy.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identification</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>“it took me 6 years to get my license.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sometimes the needs of trafficking victims do not get addressed. One reason for this can be that assistance is refused by persons who are trafficked or by service organizations trafficking victims try to get help at. Brunovskis and Surtees (2007) found that assistance is sometimes refused because victims have trouble navigating the assistance system, or because of social and cultural barriers and personal trafficking experiences. Difficulties faced by victims are due to lack of or miss-information about assistance, lack of understanding about what is offered by different organizations, declining assistance because services were not suited to a victims’ needs or situations, fear of the trafficker,
and the relationship between the service providers and beneficiaries (Brunovskis and Surtees 2007).

Housing

Table 2 shows that housing is one of the top needs clients of Calltofreedom said they had. Homelessness and unstable or unsafe housing have been associated with involvement in increased risky behavior, reduced personal safety, higher rates of morbidity and mortality and increased barriers to accessing health care for victims of human trafficking (Lazarus et al. 2012). When asked about her biggest needs while recovering from trafficking, one Calltofreedom client responded “I needed to be emotionally stable. Stability. Being off of the streets with my daughter” (Client 3). This makes transitional housing programs for vulnerable populations increasingly important in the U.S. Transitional housing facilities that work with women in the sex industry are a relatively new phenomenon. Oseling and Weitzer (2013) estimate that approximately 37 organizations provide transitional housing to this group based on the housing first model. This model emphasizes that individuals require stable housing before they can start working on changing their lives.

Transitional housing at Calltofreedom is twofold. First, they have Marrissa’s house which is a house with eight separate apartments, but they also help clients who are transitioning out or who want to live on their own find affordable and secure housing. Secondly, they have some clients living in their own apartment outside of Marrissa’s house who receive outreach services from Calltofreedom. In the Marrissa’s house the apartments each have their own bathroom and kitchen. Groceries get delivered once a month and divided up between the clients in the Marrissa’s house and clients in outreach.
The house has a common room and an office and a room where clients can play games with the volunteers. The Marrissa’s house has a closet with clothes and necessities like shampoo, toilet paper and deodorant clients can make use of. For the clients in outreach Calltofreedom has a necessities and clothes closet at the main office. Here they also keep gas card and gift cards for various restaurants for clients or victims in immediate need.

Participant 7 said:

We get food at least once a month a big order and some other at different times.

And we try divvy it up so people are sort of getting fair amounts and they have some volunteers that you might coordinate some of them may come, one came in last weekend and took them all to Starbucks (Staff member Calltofreedom).

Transitional housing programs are important because of the many barriers women getting out of the sex industry face (Kurtz et al. 2005; Lazarus et al. 2012). These barriers include both structural and individual barriers like a criminal record which makes it difficult to find affordable and safe housing, lack of transportation, stigmatization by the community and sometimes social services’ restrictive office hours or program requirements and spatial dispersal of services (Mekolichick, Davis and Chouinard 2008). Participant 1 mentioned her struggle with her criminal record: “Jobs, housing because if you are a felon you cannot pass a background check on housing. Because all the housing is usually crime free well when you are a felon you can’t get in anything” (Client 1). This last barrier makes transitional housing in rural states like South Dakota especially important as South Dakota only has two shelters, of which Calltofreedom is one, specifically for trafficked women, on either side of the state. Participant 16 mentioned:
I would love to just give Calltofreedom a lot of money. The shelter that they have been able to open has been very helpful. I think that we need a bigger space for trafficking victims in this area. I am not sure children's inn is the perfect fit for that just because we have on a lot of other focuses but I see a big need for that in Sioux Falls. More housing that is aware of trafficking risk (Staff member domestic violence shelter).

Transitional housing organizations, like Calltofreedom’s Marrissa’s house, which house between four and thirty women, and provide long-term accommodation for periods ranging from two months to two and half years, support women trying to exit a sex trafficking situation. These facilities operate on a model similar to domestic violence shelters, with confidential and safe locations, therapeutic counseling, peer mentoring, and access to food, clothing, and other basic necessities (Dewey, Hankel and Brow 2016). However, a longer shelter stay by trafficking survivors means that, overall, less shelter space is available and fewer victims of violence can be assisted. Besides that, domestic violence shelters may not be fully prepared to provide for the security of multiple trafficking survivors, particularly when the trafficker is part of a highly organized, extensive, and well-financed network (Shigekane 2007; Busch-Armendariz, Nsonwu and Heffron 2011).

Calltofreedom’s Marissa’s house is a facility solely focused on helping victims with the complex issues they face leaving a life of sex trafficking. Some of the difficulties clients of Calltofreedom faced when they moved in were homelessness, addiction, compromised mental and physical health, criminal justice involvement, and social
services oversight of the women and/or their children. Participant 5 stated: “I needed it all. I came with no job, a mess of a situation. I needed help, serious drug problem. I was a mess” (Client 5). The literature indicates that as a component of aftercare for human trafficking victims, safe and secure shelter is a high priority need (Melbin, Sullivan and Cain 2003; Shigekane 2007; Mekolichick, Davis, and Chouinard 2008; Busch-Armendariz, Nsonwu and Heffron 2011; Nail 2015). Participant 3 described: “It has alarms on the house where we have to in by a certain time and you can’t open the door until a certain time in the morning” (Client 3). A few studies also noted that shelters should be safe and secure, protecting the women from abuse from their traffickers, media, and the community but without being confining or having a prison-like appearance.

One client noted: They are beautiful apartments. They are so modern, like, I am not a decorative person you know it feels like home. And I have an apartment. It is me and daughters. She has her own room and I have mine. It’s really beautiful, I mean it makes you feel nice. You know and so it just helps build up the confidence to be able to keep going (Client 2).

Having a place that feels like home makes the women feel valued and in control of their own life and space (Melbin, Sullivan and Cain 2003; Mekolichick, Davis and Chouinard 2008; Nail 2015).

The success of a transitional housing facility lies in part in providing support groups and a broad support system where women can learn how to develop healthy friendships and social networks. Larance and Porter (2004) found that a support group for survivors of intimate partner violence which is often part of sex trafficking or as close of a comparison provided in the research, give women the opportunity to share sensitive,
personal experiences with others who have been through similar trauma. The support
group and its growing friendships provided many resources that survivors of human
trafficking could rely upon in their healing. Similarly, Melbin, Sullivan and Cain (2003)
reported that the vast majority of the clients interviewed in their study mentioned the
supportiveness of staff and/or other female survivors as being the most important
component of their recovery and healing. Whether through support groups or individual
interactions, it was the emotional support of others that helped keep these women going.
The same is true for clients of Calltofreedom. All six clients who participated in this
study emphasized the support they have felt from the staff and volunteers at the
Marrissa’s house. One client stated:

   Just like the support of having them. And there to just guide me and direct me.
   And when I feel like giving up they really reshape my thinking and give me a
different way to look at the situation. You know, like there is always another step
   I can take that I haven’t tried and they are so gentle about it so it is hard turn
down really (Client 5).

Three clients mentioned that the interaction they have with other clients at the Marrissa’s
house has helped them move forward and feel comfortable in their own skin. Knowing
they are not the only one going through a though situation and being able to share with
people who are going through something similar makes it easier to work through and
heal.
Even just to say, "hey let’s go for coffee" and just let me vent. There is times that I can just sit and I can just ramble out stuff and they are like "do you feel better". That all I needed was just somebody to talk to (Client 1).

One client mentioned that she feels bad for the women who do not have their children with them at the house. She feels uncomfortable talking to them because she feels guilty that she has her daughter with her. She mentioned a separate house for women with children might make this situation easier. “So, if there was a house with just women and their children than you didn't have to feel. You feel a little bit guilty that you have your child with you” (Client 3).

Two clients mentioned other shelters, domestic violence or homeless shelters, they stayed in. They mentioned not feeling the love and support they feel at Marrissa’s house or the closeness to the other women living there.

Yes, we kind of become family. and that is very different to because like at the Children’s Inn, that was the shelter I was in, it is just not that way. There is fight, it is uncomfortable there is drama. And I never been to any of the other ones in town but I have heard stories form the other girls. and here we are a family and you can’t take us away from each other. It is cool (Client 5).

Even though the Marrissa’s house is a success according to the clients who live there some challenges still exist. Calltofreedom staff members and other service providers have reported difficulties in providing and assessing service needs. Barriers identified by service providers included lack of adequate resources, funding, specific training on
human trafficking, ineffective coordination between federal and local agencies, language barriers, safety concerns, lack of education about victim’s rights, and a lack of formal rules and regulations (Clawson and Dutch 2008).

When asked what clients would like to change about Calltofreedom, more staff in the office and the house was mentioned by all six clients and Calltofreedom professionals. The reasons behind this varied from getting more personal attention from the same person, to reaching more victims, and to being able to have more activities at the house. A family member stated: “But let’s say she did then yes, then a place of safety, a place with programs, a place where she could get a job, be accepted and she can begin her life again. In essence it is a Marissa's house on steroids”. When staff members of Calltofreedom were asked about challenges they face in the house they also mentioned more staffing. Other challenges that they mentioned was more organized activities, especially in a group setting, to keep their clients busy. More skills training, so clients can build skills they can use when transitioning out of the Marrissa’s house was something they would like to start. Ultimately the biggest challenge they saw is funding to make overcoming all these challenges happen.

I think what we are doing now is working as well as it can. It feels like we need some more funding and it feels like we need a bigger space for trafficking victims to go. I say funding what I really mean is unrestricted, not unrestricted like never-ending amounts but unrestricted in terms of it can be used in many different ways, because each trafficking victims has very specific things that they need (Staff member Calltofreedom).
Through grants, collaboration with other organizations and more education and awareness in the community Calltofreedom is growing its organization. Through this growth the staff members hope to be able to overcome the challenges they face in the future.

Case management

Calltofreedom is a case management organization. Case management is a system of managing each individual clients’ recovery and reintegration process. The case manager coordinates services based on the needs identified in a needs assessment (Muraya and Fry 2016). Calltofreedom has recently implemented a needs assessment tool in their intake protocol which they designed in collaboration with one of their first clients who had navigated the system herself before finding Calltofreedom. She stated:

They didn't haven an assessment when I started. It was just like ok what do we do you know how do we progress from here what is the next step. Where now Becky and them, have worked towards an assessment so they see right away what the needs are do we need to get them into rehab, do we need them counseling, do we need to get them this or that (Client 1).

This assessment has helped Calltofreedom to get an indication of the client’s immediate needs so no time is wasted. It also helps track which needs are most common for grant proposals and funding purposes.

Two U.S. based studies showed that meeting the needs of victims of trafficking is a multidisciplinary and multiagency effort because of the complex needs these clients
have (Wirsing 2012; Muraya and Fray 2016). Other studies throughout the world share the view that case management is the best way to manage this multidisciplinary and multiagent effort so a victim does not have to navigate the system by themselves (Wolte and Tautz 2007; Asquith and Turner 2008; Frederick 2012; Van der Keur 2013).

Participant 16 mentioned:

I am a case manager here so my job is to help them with housing, jobs, child care if that is needed and so I will help them find housing they feel safe in, go on apartment tours with them, talk about what jobs they might feel safe in. Recently with a trafficking victim who want to leave the area, my job was to call several other trafficking shelters and just arrange for the logistics of that and make sure they would be able take her (Staff member domestic violence shelter).

A case manager can be a source of continuity and emotional support for a survivor of trafficking. Additionally, the case manager leads the case management team which is a small group of professionals involved in meeting the psychological, legal, physical health, social welfare, educational, and economic needs of the survivor (Muraya and Fry 2016).

Clients and staff of Calltofreedom who participated in this research indicate that case management is a big part of the recovery process and helps the survivors find the help they need. Participant 7 explained:

That is part of the case management, it is navigation, it is really helping to remove the obstacles like no cars sometimes no phones sometimes no clothes. It is trying
to remove those obstacles that are keeping them from self-sufficiency and getting to the places and the people that they need and it is more intensive than the case management that I have been involved in before because I think their needs are more complex (Staff member Calltofreedom).

Other organization also see the need for case management and its benefits to their clients. A counselor said:

Just more of a case management approach. Sometimes I think folks involved in trafficking get lost in the folds because they are receiving services one place and another place and that gets overwhelming, especially when you are getting out of trafficking it is really overwhelming to have to go lots of places and figure out how to do that (Counselor).

Some literature shows that case management is the best way of ensuring that recovery and reintegration services are successful and sustainable and result in wide-ranging, flexible, and effective service provision. Having one coordinator making sure all service providers are on the same page makes it possible to addresses many needs at once (Asquith and Turner 2008; Van der Keur 2013). Participant 7 explained:

So, I do the clinical coordination and I also do the coordination with like probation officers and drug court. we have one client that is in drug court and so keep, keeping communication so we are all on the same page. Making sure that they have signed releases so we can all, I think we do much better when everyone, when there are not secrets among different groups (Staff member Calltofreedom).
Some of Calltofreedom’s community partners are laid out in Figure 1. Some specific organizations Calltofreedom works with that were mentioned by participant 8 are:

Children's inn, Community outreach, Dress for Success, Keystone CD, Care institute CD, Journey counseling is my favorite, my personal favorite. Some work with stronghold but they are kind of picky about their fees they don’t cut people much slack. Compass center, we had some people going there for counseling. Food bank even though we don’t use their transport but they usually have the ability to go out there themselves and they do. DSS we have done some training there and then they have, they’re pretty good with us. Community health they are great with us. They give our people priority and they don’t have to sit and wait for two hours. We can call within 24 hours and they will get them in. What am I missing. Junior league and New colossus to some extent. The family planning part usually comes from community health (Staff member Calltofreedom).
The collaboration between organizations is very important to ensure the victims' needs are met and everybody stays on the same page. Calltofreedom staff spent a lot of time making connections and making sure their clients get the help they need and no one is falling through the cracks. Participant 8 noted: “I usually talk to a therapist or probation officer pretty much every day between, and Thursday I usually try to go to drug court because I think it is really important to hear what happens with that client” (Staff member Calltofreedom). Calltofreedom does not only collaborate on the client level with for instance shelters and mental health organizations but also on the community level by
educating parents, youth and teachers about human trafficking and what Calltofreedom does.

On the community level Calltofreedom collaborates through education and awareness campaigns, trainings and presentations for the public, law enforcement and other social service organizations. They meet with different social service and law enforcement organizations weekly or monthly. They are part of the east river human trafficking task force and are trying to find new partners whenever there is a new need their clients have. Participant 8 described:

If you ask how, it is phone calls it is emails its texts its meetings its really just keeping the relationships alive and Becky is really good at what she does in those areas with funding and legislation same kind of thing. It’s kind of that building the relationships and from there, and some of the groups are a little intimidating to me. I didn't have great experiences with probation officers before but trough drug court the once that work with drug court are just great to work with (Staff member Calltofreedom).

All the other service organizations are positive about their collaboration with Calltofreedom. Participant 17 stated:

It is great it is really nice. You know we are not a trafficking shelter so we don't always know what we are doing and so Becky herself has come here several times to meet with clients. We have had Cheryl come, and a couple of their staff. I think
the collaboration is good because it helps the clients (Staff member Domestic abuse shelter).

Privacy laws are a challenge in collaboration between organization. These laws can make it difficult to discuss specific clients with other organizations. If clients have not signed a disclosure waiver, information cannot be shared between organization which can make collaboration more difficult.

Counseling

Studies on the psychological impact of trafficking show that some survivors experience symptoms of long-term psychological trauma due to the coercion, physical and emotional abuse and stigma of trafficking. Women and girls trafficked into the sex industry often report feelings of depression, feelings of hopelessness, numbness and isolated (Dewan 2011). Participant 17 noted:

Usually a trafficking victim is gonna need some more heavy-duty counseling so since they are staying in our building that is nice because our counselor is right there. So, when they do have a very hard day there's someone right there to talk with them (Staff member domestic violence shelter).

Other victims describe difficulty sleeping, and feeling easily alarmed, on guard, worthless, being trapped, paranoid, and ashamed (Contreras, Kallivayalil and Herman 2017; Landers et al. 2017). Some victims report turning their anger and rage inward to thoughts of suicide and suicide attempts. Women describe multiple attempts at self-injury
through drug overdoses, engaging in high-risk sexual behavior, self-harm, wrist slitting, and attempts to poison and hang themselves (Contreras, Kallivayalil and Herman 2017).

It is important to make long term treatments available for survivors of human trafficking. Short term treatments may help decrease specific symptoms of depression or Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), but addressing the survivor’s relational and identity challenges will require a strong therapeutic relationship that is consistent, predictable, and sustained over a long period of time (Stotts and Ramey 2009).

A counselor can help counter the consequences of human trafficking by guiding the survivor through a process that will take away the shame related to her experiences and rebuild the basic sense of trust that has been destroyed. The first step to take is to help the survivor understand her own situation which can mean that the experience of trafficking can change over time, from identifying as prostitution by choice, to trafficked victim, and finally to survivor (Contreras, Kallivayalil and Herman 2017). Participant 15 collaborated this by saying:

Many of the people that are victims of trafficking don’t often identify themselves as victims of human trafficking so it not until later in the counseling relationship that we discover all the trafficking stuff. So, part of it is just education, acknowledging that this thing that they are talking about is this whole other separate form of victimization that is different than pure sexual violence it is different than domestic violence it is trafficking and so really part of the first step is educating them about that face that they are a survivor of trafficking, what that
mean how that impact them and then connecting them to resources throughout the community (Counselor).

A counselor should form relationships with several other organizations, be aware of different perspectives about human trafficking which can influence the survivors feeling guilt or shame. A counselor must consider the inherent power imbalances of the psychotherapist–patient relationship. Taking it slow and let the survivor make decisions about the needs they have or care they which to receive is an important way to instill trust and empower the survivor.

One of the counseling organizations Calltofreedom partners with offers free services to victims of sexual assault, domestic violence and human trafficking. Their services are confidential and pseudo names can be used to avoid traffickers finding out information about victims. This makes it easier and less scary for some victims to come forward according to one of the counselors. This organization offers ongoing counseling for ages three all the way through adulthood. They have five counselors in their office and a lawyer who can help with any legal needs other than pressing charges. This organization also offers offender-based services to help offenders to stay away from harming anybody else. Participant 15 explained:

I think it is most important for them to have a safe place that in whatever way they are engaging with the system that they feel safe and that they know that the people who are helping them are safe people that are not going to take advantage of them. When you are coming out of trafficking you are so used to people taking advantage of you that it is hard to come and ask for help and not expect that the person sitting
across form you is taking advantage. So, I think just creating that safety is the most important part (Counselor).

One of the challenges related to counseling, mentioned by a family member of a trafficking survivor, was that her trafficking situation could have been avoided if the counselor they saw when she was little, had look deeper into the family situation.

I think they look at symptoms rather than looking at what is cause. They look at the symptoms and try to teach them how to correct behavior, well what is causing the behavior. Because that was always the issue the behavior was discussed, the lying was discussed. Well why is she lying, she is lying because she was told not to tell the truth and so it becomes, she is 3 years old 4 years old, 5 years old. She's told not tell, she is told not to tell the truth so she learns. They learn (Family member).

Her suggestion is that counselors should be better trained in recognizing signs of unhealthy family settings, like in the case of her granddaughter, pornography in the house and child exposure to sexual acts at a young age. These family settings can lead to vulnerabilities in the child that might lead to trafficking in the future. Early recognition might have prevented her granddaughter from becoming vulnerable to trafficking.

Employment and skills training

Unemployment and poverty are major sources of vulnerability for trafficking. This makes having a job and being financially independent very important for victims of trafficking to reduce the chance of revictimization. To help survivors of trafficking find employment, vocational training, education enrollment, resume writing, and job searching skills should be part of the services provided (Kaufman and Crawford 2011;
Wirsing 2012). Some victims lack any formal education and relevant skills for employment. Some useful life skills recommended for aftercare services are finance management, transportation use, safety planning, life planning, decision making, conflict resolution, problem solving, emotional management, and interpersonal communication (Frederick 2005; Wirsing 2012).

All the clients who participated in this research are currently employed. Calltofreedom works with community partners to find suitable and safe employment options for their clients. For women who live in the Marrissa’s house, jobs must be between certain hours because the house goes on lock down at night. This makes it more difficult to find employment. Most of the clients work part time and according to staff members of Calltofreedom might never work fulltime because of the trauma they endured, treatment programs they are in or law enforcement commitments. Two clients specifically mentioned how much they like their work. One had her first day on the day of the interview but was excited about working again. “I love it. It is laundry and cleaning at night. So, I am basically by myself but that actually gives me the motivation to get things done” (Client 3).

A challenge mentioned by staff members of Calltofreedom and a domestic abuse shelter is the fact that their clients often end up in minimum wage paying jobs. These jobs make it very difficult for survivors of trafficking to become financially stable and independent, especially when they have children.

I think it is very challenging for them to go back to a McDonald's or something like that. Because in my experience talking with women who have been through this, yes it was violent, yes it was bad the trafficking but in between the violence
in the back they felt important or they felt like they were providing an important service which is sad really, but you know they don’t feel that way about other work and they made, some of them made good money being trafficked in a way. I mean a lot of the time pimps will take that from you and will be violent with you but so realizing wow I am working this minimum-wage job and this is all the money that am going to get think that can be very challenging (Staff domestic abuse shelter).

A challenge mention by one of the clients of Calltofreedom is finding a job when you have a criminal record. Most jobs do criminal background checks and any person with a criminal record is dismissed straight away, even if the crime was a long time ago or if the crime was committed during a trafficking situation. “I did 250 applications before I got a job just because I am a felon. And you know I am not saying that we should .... in it but they should kind of word it like ok. My crime has been over 20 years but I still have to list it” (Client 1). Having difficulty finding work increases the chance for a women to go back to their trafficker and getting revictimized.

Education and awareness

A need seen not only for victims of trafficking but also in the community is education and awareness about human trafficking. As mentioned before, victims of trafficking often do not see themselves as victims or do not even realize that there is a word for what they are going through. In the community, awareness is needed to take away stigma, to help recognize signs or red flags, which is especially important for law enforcement, health care providers and teachers and to provide advocacy to survivors. Hounmenou (2012) conducted a study into awareness about human trafficking and
trafficking laws and policies among service providers and law enforcement in the state of Illinois. This study found that there is a lack of awareness about domestic trafficking, child sexual exploitation and the laws and policies around human trafficking. A study by Clawson and Dutch (2008) found that the lack of knowledge and understanding about trafficking among service providers and law enforcement was one of the biggest frustrations among the participants in this study. They also noted that even victims themselves often do not believe or understand that they are a victim of a crime. As a result, victims often go unidentified and unserved. Calltofreedom and other service organizations like New Colossus and Junior League and different law enforcement agencies are trying hard to provide the community with knowledge and understanding about trafficking. Participant 6 explains:

I work with Becky on presentations, do some research, like we are doing one soon with keystone and so we are doing some research on the intersections of addiction and sex trafficking. And sometimes we just presenting our program which is easy as sometimes there is some other reason but have had quite a few presentations throughout the state. And we have several more coming up and then I also assist with grants (Staff member Calltofreedom).

Often victims of trafficking disclose to a teacher, a taxi driver or health care provider. If their knowledge about human trafficking is good and they know who to get involved, the client will receive better care and it reduces the chance of revictimization. One client mentioned:
I never even thought that I would need, that I needed it. But all the abuse that I have been put through I guess I just never knew that this type of help was out there. Yeah, I mean it is, it feels like it is underground, like not underground but invisible where nobody can really see it but that is a good thing because if everybody sees it than a lot of women are going to be in trouble (Client 3).

Trainings at schools to teach children what and who to look out for regarding trafficking and who they can talk to if they have a problem will prevent some kids from getting into a trafficking situation.

South Dakota Law enforcement also goes into schools and trains children not only about human trafficking but also about the vulnerabilities that can create a human trafficking situation. Participant 12 noted: “I would rather draw attention to the vulnerabilities that are created and things that contribute to trafficking. The number one risk factor is child sexual abuse and number two is being in foster care or the foster care system (Computer Forensic Specialist). She explained that teaching kids about their behavior online like sexting or sending nude photographs of themselves can lead to trafficking situations. Talking about the consequences of their online interactions helps them understand their vulnerabilities and how someone can take advantage of those. Law enforcement organizations are very positive about their educational collaboration with Calltofreedom. Participant 13 said:

Calltofreedom has now become the expert in sex trafficking. They have done a phenomenal job in educating themselves. And three years ago, they impressed me
so much to the point where I know these are the leading folks in sex trafficking and who we need to go to for help (Law enforcement officer).

Working together with different organizations to educate the community and create awareness has resulted in more calls to the human trafficking hot line. This does not mean that there is more trafficking but that victims are more willing to come forward and trust that there is help out there (Polaris Project 2017). This is also a challenge for service providers. Participant 18 noted: “awareness is wonderful but what do you do after.” (Staff member The Network). When more victims come forward the amount of services needs to increase to fit the need.

Other

Other less researched needs clients of Calltofreedom mentioned were, transportation, child care, documentation and activities. Transportation is a problem. Often clients arrive at Calltofreedom with nothing, least of all a car. In large cities transportation causes problems because teaching clients how to use public transportation can be overwhelming and very time consuming. Service providers report clients missing appointments because they were afraid to use public transportation. In smaller communities, public transportation is scares or non-existent, also making it difficult for clients to get to appointments (Clawson and Dutch 2008). Participant 18 sees transportation as a problem in Sioux Falls:

It is hard when you are talking about a person who is trafficked who has no access to a vehicle, has no access to money, how are they going to get from place to
place. If we had that kind of location that could be one stop shop, where people could get to that one safe place and have access to tons of resources (Counselor).

Calltofreedom arranges transportation for their clients if they need it. They can let one of the staff members know 24 hours before an appointment and they will drive the client there. One of the clients mentioned: “They were right there. They picked me up and took me up there and gave me a ride back” (Client 3). A staff member explained:

But anyway, so like today I picked [Client] up and she had a therapy appointment. We don’t always drive them to appointments but her, her therapist is out away and there is no bus out there. So especially for medical or therapy appointments I think it is important that we assist with transportation.

For clients who have a car Calltofreedom can provide gas cards. These are gift cards with small amounts of money on them that clients can use to fill up their car. These gift cards often get donated by members of the community. A solution mentioned by multiple service organizations is to have one organization with all the resources under one roof. Housing, counseling, skills training, medical care and chemical dependency programs all in the same building so clients do not have to travel.

Child care was mentioned as a need by two clients who have their daughter living in the Marrisa’s house with them. Participant 6 mentioned: “There are gaps in the community for evening and weekend childcare for all ages but really bad gaps in the summer for middle school kids” (Client 6). Calltofeedom does not offer child care when clients are at work in the evenings. The Boys and Girls club has been mentioned as a
solution by Calltofreedom staff but they are not open over the weekend or late at night. Also, getting the children there with the lack of transportation for the clients of Calltofreedom is a problem.

Another challenge faced by clients is documentation. Clawson and Dutch (2008) found that most of the service providers they interviewed about the needs of their clients, mentioned documentation was as a challenge. Obtaining identification documents like passports, birth certificates or driver’s licenses is an important need for all victims in order to access services. Often these documents are taken away by the trafficker as a way of control over the victim and keep them from escaping. Participant 1 said about her experience: “as a survivor or victim they take that away from you, they take your identity away. So, the fight through all the red tape you know the name changes, the divorces, the mirages all that stuff. I had to get all that stuff document to get a license” (Client 1). Clawson and Dutch (2008) also founds that in interaction with law enforcement not having identification can sometimes lead to traumatic experiences for victims of trafficking. “One service provider told of an incident where a client was removed from public transportation and placed in detention because the client did not have any identification on his/her person” (Clawson and Dutch 2008).

The last need addressed in this chapter is individual or group activities for the clients. Staff members from Calltofreedom and clients mentioned they do not know what to do with their time now that they are clean and out of their trafficking situation. Participant 8 explained:
They really didn't know what to do with leisure, they are not using or having sex so it is like what do you do. So, we finally did get the little antenna's for so they could get some tv stations but their all kind of antsy so they don’t watch much tv which is ok bit I would like em to get a little more involved and I kinda like to maybe do an informal group on current events or something cause I think they very into now they are taking ownership of the house (Staff member Calltofreedom).

Calltofreedom tries to get volunteers to take the clients out and create activities at the house. Participant 7 said:

A couple of them got very involved in painting. We again tried to get some games going that was a little slower but just kind of perusing some of their interests. We had a therapist one night and they did do a dinner and they don’t want to tell you of course in the mids of it and then afterward they are like that was really cool when we had that community dinner Friday night and watched a movie (Staff member Calltofreedom).

The clients mentioned that these actives help them connect with each other and fill the time they are not at work or in counseling. Participant 3 mentioned: “I mean we have picknicks and ice cream parties. We haven’t really done much as it is hard to get everyone together and have an event because everyone is working” (Client 3). Besides all the different schedules the clients have, staff is also a challenge for Calltofreedom. To get more activities and programs going at Marrissa’s house Calltofreedom needs more staff and more funding.
Findings 2: Memorable messages, labeling and stigma

In chapter one I have identified the success and challenges of Calltofreedom and other service organizations. Another challenge social service organizations face in working with survivors of trafficking is not material, but it is a survivor’s mentality. Creating the best services in the world means nothing if participants are not identified or if they are not willing to participate. This chapter will look at how memorable messages, stigma and labeling influence the mentality of clients of Calltofreedom. Additionally, the chapter will examine how service organizations and law enforcement can help create positive messages to help overcome the negative mentality survivors of trafficking have initially. How memorable messages can change this mentality over time by taking away the stigma of sexual exploitation, addressing the labeling of survivors by the community and countering the memorable messages instilled in a survivor’s brain will also be addressed.

Memorable messages:
Understanding the process of how people assess their daily behaviors may provide social service organizations with an understanding of how to give positive guidance and to encourage survivors of trafficking to make decisions they will be proud of. Memorable messages are messages that are remembered for a long time and that people see as having a major influence on their life (Knapp et al. 1981). These messages often contain advice that leads people to change their thinking and start behaving in positive but sometimes also in negative ways (Knapp, Stohl and Reardon 1981; Smith et al. 2001). This means that positive messages sent from important primary sources that encourage people to live up to certain standards such as “Be kind” or “Respect yourself” are more likely to create positive actions and behaviors. On the other hand, negative
messages like “You are worthless” or “You don’t deserve better” are more likely to result in negative behavior or actions (Knapp, Stohl and Reardon 1981).

Knapp et al. (1981) also looked at what makes memorable messages memorable. This can be important information for service providers who want to give their clients a message that will be remembered. In their 1981 study Knapp et al. showed that memorable messages have five characteristics that make them memorable. First, memorable messages were found to be short oral messages. Second, the messages were personal, and about important problems or experiences in people's lives and were told at often difficult or challenging points in time. They could provide the receiver with ways to resolve a difficult situation, offer guidance in a confusing situation or be a message of hope. Third, the messages provided rules of appropriate behavior and offered ideas for dealing with different situations. Even though the message was told in a specific situation, it could be applied to different experiences. Fourth, the content of the messages showed conservative social values and attitudes that would most benefit the preservation of the social network. They would provide rules to live by and give an understanding of cultural norms. Lastly, the person giving the message was viewed as older and wiser and therefore seen as having higher status than the person receiving the message. The sender's credibility seemed both to legitimize the message and make it easier to recall (Knapp et al. 1981).

Table 3: Types and frequencies of memorable messages

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Message type</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>“You can do it.”</td>
<td>Calltofreedom staff</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows memorable messages received by the six clients of Calltofreedom who participated in the research. They were asked to identify any memorable messages that related to their trafficking experiences or the recovery process. Each Calltofreedom client divulged a motivational memorable message (see Table 3). Forms of supportive messages can be emotional by expressing comfort and caring, informative by giving advice or guidance, building self-esteem by bolstering a person’s sense of competence or self-worth, tangible by offering services or resources, and networking by helping achieve membership in a group where members share similar interests (Cutrona and Russell 1990; Cutrona and Suhr 1992). Further, each motivational memorable message came from Calltofreedom staff. Most of the messages recalled by the clients from Calltofreedom staff members fall in the emotional and building self-esteem category. Supportive communication has the potential to contribute to a variety of positive
outcomes, including health and well-being. For example, Participant 5 recalled a CalltoFreedom staff member constantly saying, “Don’t quit C, you are not a quitter”. These kinds of supportive messages are important to build a trust relationship and to help victims through what to do next. Esteem support is most helpful in decision making and to empower victims to carry out their decisions (Holmstrom et al. 2017). Additionally, Participant 2 remembered always hearing “You are worth more than that” from staff. She found it to be helpful/build self-esteem because she never had anyone tell her that she was worth something without that person wanting something in return. All clients felt heard and loved by these messages. It gave them the motivation and self-esteem they needed to keep going. They felt like they were part of a family.

Only two clients, recalled a message that was faith based. Participant 6 felt this message was helpful to her as she needed to find her faith to be able to keep going. One client said the message “God has bigger plans for me” made her feel like she belonged and had the support of someone (God) in her life. A study by Keely (2004) shows that religious and spiritual messages can give a person a feeling of validation and comfort but can also make them feel like part of a community. This feeling is especially important to victims of trafficking as they often do not have a network or support system. Baker and Grove (2013) found that victims questioning their self-worth in a crisis is an opportunity where service providers can use God and the bible to offer their clients options to choose a path. Faith can be a support to start a new life. One client found the message “pray for yourself” to be particularly helpful because it gave her hope and self-worth. She was allowed to pray for herself and to pray for better things.
Memorable messages are often received from a person the recipient holds in great esteem, like a family member, friend, teacher, or law enforcement officer (Knapp et al. 1981). Four clients recalled messages that prevented them from looking for help. All of these messages were told to them by a family member. Braithwaite and Scott (1991) point out that personal values are serving as motivational, prescriptive, and proscriptive functions. According to them, if behavior undermines these personal values, guilt, shame, and general negative emotions can be a result. If behavior exceeds these personal values, higher self-esteem results. For example, Participant 5 recalled:

When I was a kid and with my parents it was like, it didn't matter how well you did it there was always room for failure. They just picked at the part that brought out the failure instead of the success. I guess that is what kept me in the life. Not worth anything better I am just a failure. Or it is like with failure comes shame so don’t even try this because you just gonna feel shame from this (Client 5).

The client who recalled this message had internalized this message so far that she did not only recall it but also started to give herself the same messages. It made her go back to her trafficker because she believed this was the best she deserved. Another client remembered message from her mom saying, “You are one of those mistake babies” (Client 6). This message made her feel like she was a mistake, and no one would care what would happen to her. The messages that prevented the clients of Calltofreedom from looking for help all showed that they undermined their family’s values and therefore their own values which led to feelings of guilt, shame and failure.
Four clients recalled memorable messages that they told themselves. This was either a message formally told to them by someone else or something an experience brought on. Three of those messages were messages of motivation after a negative experience. One participant said, “I am not going to let the fear take over and destroy what I worked so hard for” (Client 1) after the specific set-back of being told no after a job application. Another participant told herself “He is going to take my home from me” (Client 5) when she felt unsafe after running into her trafficker. These internalized messages kept them going through these difficult situations. The fourth message “I am not worth anything better, I am just a failure” (Client 5) was one that the client started telling herself after hearing it form her parents for many years. This message made her go back to an abusive boyfriend many times and it prevented her from looking for a way out of this abusive relationship.

After recalling the memorable messages, the clients were asked when they recalled the messages. Smith and Ellis (2001), Smith et al. (2001) and Ellis and Smith (2004) found that memorable messages are often recalled in various contexts. In these studies, three different contexts were identified. First, these studies noted that people recalled memorable messages when they did something that surpassed their goals and of which they are proud. Second, memorable messages were recalled to stop people from engaging in behavior that they would regret later. Lastly, these studies found that memorable messages were recalled when the action taken is something the person is not proud of and regrets. Clients of Calltofreedom were asked if the memorable messages recalled sparked a reaction fitting in one or more of these three contexts. First, what was something of which they were proud when a memorable message was recalled? Second,
did the message stopped them from doing something they would later regret? And third, did a message come to mind when they did something of which they were not proud?

Most of the memorable messages the clients of Calltofreedom recalled sparked a reaction they were proud of. Five clients told about something they were proud of because of memorable messages received from Calltofreedom staff members. One client mentioned her sobriety as something she was proud of “I am 123 days sober” (Client 4). She said that without the message from Calltofreedom staff she would not have been able to. Two other clients mentioned work related actions of which they were proud. Participant 5 said, “I just went and got through fire training”. She was proud that she could overcome some of the setbacks she had during the training like people looking into her criminal background and family history, with the memorable messages she received from Calltofreedom. Participant 3 noted “I got a job”. The day of the interview was going to be her fist day at work and she said the same message of encouragement that got her the job would help her make it through the first day.

Three clients remembered recalling a message that made them stop doing something they would later regret. Participant 2 recalled having a lot of difficulty finding a job because of her criminal record which made her feel very overwhelmed. She wanted to go back to jail where everything was structured, where she had a roof over her head, three meals a day, and a hot shower. Memorable messages from Calltofreedom staff about not quitting made her stop behaving in way that would get her arrested. She said, “It prevented me from going back to jail and finding the strength to keep going.” Another client stated, “I wanted to just go to the bar and drink” after feeling very overwhelmed when first arriving at Calltofreedom. Having to work through her trauma, find a job and
living in Marrissa’s house with other people made her want to go back to her comfort zone of alcohol abuse. The same overwhelming feeling was felt by participant 6. She mentioned, “I just wanted to dig a hole and stay there”. Memorable messages like “you can do it” and “you have come so far already” made her keep going and prevented her from falling into a depression.

Only one participant remembered recalling a memorable message after she did something she was not proud of. She said, “I’ll leave (the shelter) during the day and come back more beat up than I left.” A message that ‘she was worth more than that’ told to her by staff members of Calltofreedom made her believe she deserved a better life and made her realize that what she was doing was not a solution to low self-esteem. You have believe in yourself first to be able to heal and the message from Calltofreedom made her believe.

Staff members of Calltofreedom and other service organizations and law enforcement officers were asked what kind of memorable message they give or want to give victims of trafficking and what they do to get this message across. Knowing what kind of memorable messages victims of human trafficking receive and how these messages influence their behavior may help improve the lives of women before getting trafficked. These messages can also be helpful in identifying victims and helping them get out of their trafficking situation by providing positive messages women need to redirect their lives. Table 4 shows the specific message different service providers give or want to give victims of trafficking and what action they take to get the message across.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Message</th>
<th>Action to get message across</th>
<th>Source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“That they deserve better and that they do have worth and that people do care. And that they can do it.”</td>
<td>Tell them as much as possible.</td>
<td>Staff member Calltofreedom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are worth something and I am not gonna let them give up on this.</td>
<td>I Just, I tell them over and over again.</td>
<td>Staff member domestic abuse shelter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Your brain is responding normally in an abnormal situation”</td>
<td>Teach my clients about the brain and how it works</td>
<td>Counselor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Your body and brain did exactly what it needed to do.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Stop blaming the victim.”</td>
<td>Put these messages out to the community or services organizations.</td>
<td>Staff member of The Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“This isn’t about us.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I care and I am afraid for you.”</td>
<td>Make a personal connection with the victims</td>
<td>Law enforcement officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“There will be things you will try that fail but there will be that one opportunity in which it works, keep trying.”</td>
<td>Tell them every opportunity I can get</td>
<td>Law enforcement officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;love em”</td>
<td>&quot;Show em that you mean it.”</td>
<td>Family member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I love you no matter what.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I can help take revenge.”</td>
<td>Tell them while showing them the prosecution process.</td>
<td>Prosecutor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Life is not short, it is long and this might not be the most significant thing that”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
happens to you. You can still win.”

| “You are not alone in this” | If I know the patient is a victim. | Health Care Professional |

All of the message stated in Table 4 fit the five characteristics mentioned by Knapp et al. (1981). All the messages are short and to the point. They are personal, show emotion and recognize the persons difficult situation. The counselor’s message “Your brain is responding normally in an abnormal situation” shows that she wants the client to understand that nothing that has happened is her fault. She wants to take the “why” question, for example “why didn’t I scream” or “why didn’t I fight back”, away for her clients. By educating them on how the brain works in traumatic and abnormal situations she wants to show her clients that they did exactly what they needed to do to stay safe and therefore take away the guilt and shame that prevents clients from healing. The prosecutor’s message “I can help take revenge” provides women with an option of dealing with their situation. Taking revenge by getting justice can provide closure he says. By showing victims the court and making them understand the system he tries to empower them to stand up to their trafficker and get that closer. “There will be things you will try that fail but there will be that one opportunity in which it works, keep trying.” This message was given by a victim whiteness assistant to show victims that failure is a part of life and it should not keep you from trying again. She had never thought of memorable messages before and will try and teach memorable messages in the seminars she provides for law enforcement officers. She said: “We need to recant the voice that is already there”. Meaning we need to take out the negative message of the trafficker and replace it with a positive message that we care and want to help. Lastly, all messages
were provided by members of society that are seen as older and wiser by most people. Especially law enforcement officers could be seen as credible and truthful but on the other hand could also be perceived as someone to stay away from by victims of trafficking. Due to stigma and labeling many victims of trafficking have negative experiences with law enforcement. One client recalled:

I ran into a problem when I was working at a hotel one of the people that was involved in my case was there as a guest and I had a flashback and freaked out and went to the cops and tried to turn him in and it didn't work. So, I think they don't have very much knowledge. Like they threaten to arrest me when I was trying to explain. And I am, like you don't, you are not listening to words coming, they didn't understand at all (Client 2).

As law enforcement officers are often the first contact victims have with any service providers it is of high importance that law enforcement officers have an understanding of memorable messages and how to make victims of trafficking hear them. For service organizations like Calltofreedom, messages of encouragement and love are most important as they build self-esteem and trust relationship which prevent victims from going back to their traffickers. Messages that explain what has happened to a victim and help her understand her situation are also of importance so victims can move on from being a victim to being a survivor.

Two service providers mentioned messages that they want to put out there for the community. Participant 13 explained:
I think that both trafficking and domestic violence while they come while men can be victims of both we are seeing is primarily female victims which is systematic of this structure that we have as a culture. I do not believe that men are inherently violent and yet we have all these men who are abusers and traffickers so that is telling me that we are sending our little boys messages that violence is okay and we are sending our little girls messages that having violence done to them is ok. It is never the victims fault I am not saying that but if you go back even to when you were a kid a little girl and a boy pulls your hair, someone might say “Well he does that because he likes you” and it just starts right there. Okay well if he is being violent to me it is ok (Staff member Domestic abuse shelter).

She believes that as a society and a community we need to change our memorable message to prevent boys from becoming violent and to empower girls that, having violence done to you is not acceptable. She said that if we can start turning this message around at young age sex trafficking in the future might be prevented. Another participant said she want to tell the public “Stop blaming the victims” and “it is not about us”. She feels that as a society we blame the victims which makes it very difficult for service providers to create a trust relationship. Making the public aware of different situations in which trafficking can take place, how women end up in these situations and educating the public that it is not about them but about helping the victim will go a long way to prevent blame.
Stigma and labels

Prostitution has been seen as immoral and promiscuous throughout history. As a result, both legal consequences and social stigmatization have been mostly directed towards women who sell sexual services rather than men who purchase the services (Esselstyn 1968; Flowers 1998). However, recently a cultural shift to less stigmatizing terms and language has been seen within service organizations that might help to reach women who have remained invisible and trapped in traumatic trafficking situations (Reid 2010). Now yesterday’s prostitute or criminal is viewed and labeled as today’s victim or survivor. This shift is an important one as it changes the way we look at prostitutes and prostitution. Sex trafficking then becomes the appropriate term to refer to all forms of forced prostitution, even among many women identified as consenting sex workers (Reid 2010). Local law enforcement began to shift its perspective regarding domestic violence in the 1990s as laws were developed to require an arrest and the enforcement of protective orders.

If we look at trafficking the way we look at how domestic violence has been structured and really comparing these two as I think the closest comparison we can get in terms of two crimes. If you are a victim of domestic violence and police are called to where you are someone has to be arrested, there is no such statute for trafficking victims so if I called police as a woman and say I am being trafficked and they show up they don't need to arrest my pimp. That is not a requirement so I think a mandatory arrest law would be incredibly helpful (Participant 16, staff member Domestic Violence Shelter).
Unfortunately, this shift has not been seen for victims of trafficking as there is no arrest requirement for this crime which sometimes makes reporting trafficking dangerous for the victim (Reid 2010).

Victims of trafficking are often reluctant to come forward because they fear retribution from their traffickers and fear arrest and or deportation in cases of international trafficking. The stigma associated with sexual exploitation in general, and prostitution, increases the difficulty in identifying victims.

One nagging issue is that often human trafficking cases only come to light when a victim gets arrested for prostitution or drugs. The challenge is to get the record cleared as the women are clearly victims and not criminals but I don’t know how that would work (Participant 14, Prosecutor).

Persons involved in both international and domestic sex trafficking are not likely to disclose their involvement in prostitution to providers, especially law enforcement, due to their own sense of shame and fear of the response (Raphael 2004; Lloyd 2005).

Other reasons that victims do not disclose their victimization include self-blame and the fear of not being believed, which leads to increased secrecy and the fear of involvement of child protective services (Roe-Sepowitz et al. 2014). A family member who participated in this study saw this happening with her granddaughter. She said, “Honestly, I mean society as a whole blames the victim really” after describing the challenges she had getting her granddaughter the help she needed after getting out of a trafficking situation. Sex trafficking victims also maintain secrecy regarding the abuse they experience at the hands of their trafficker, but their need for secrecy is further
complicated by the fact that this relationship facilitates the sex exchanges they are involved in, which are always hidden from the general public, as they are illegal in almost all of the United States. Farley (2012) identified barriers to accessing services for sex trafficking victims to include fear of prosecution, deportation related to lack of legal documentation for being in the United States, a child welfare investigation, and retaliation from their pimp or trafficker. One Client said, “I was scared, I didn’t know who was involved or who could open their mouths. Cause I mean they pretty much want you gone. If you know anything everyone wants you gone” (Client 6). This fear of retaliation from her trafficker made it difficult for her to find help. She said that even when she was safe with Calltofreedom she would see her traffickers everywhere. The paranoia and fear stayed with her even though she was safe.

Other barriers to services for sex trafficking victims may include a fear of not being taken seriously, getting insults, and humiliation from the police or services organizations (Haskell 2010). Sex trafficking victims may not be aware that they can access domestic violence services; once they do access those services, they may experience the judgment from those who are in a position to respond to the human trafficking (Haskell 2010). One client of Calltofreedom mentioned why she shied away from seeking help.

A lot of it are women who won’t come to it because of the societies type of "oh my gosh you are involved in that". You know what I mean and all of a sudden you are sitting there feeling bad about it again and it just replays over and over the cycle that we were putting ourselves in. It is like we are replaying everything over
again and all of a sudden, we get a little bit far and then someone says, "wow you are in that place, that is for freaking trafficking" you know and then all of a sudden you shy back” (Client 4).

This type of interaction with people made her feel like there was something wrong with her. She felt like an attraction and like no one was going to understand her so it was better to not try and look for help so she would not get disappointed.

Sex trafficking victims are often not first identified as victims but as criminals, blamed for their victimization and stigmatized by the labels we place upon them (Kotrla 2010). Some of these labels come forth out of legal terms for the crime they committed like prostitute or prostitution but other terms are slang used to demean them like “slut” and “whore”. Labeling theory is a theory used in criminology and criminal justice to explain that being labeled as a “deviant” leads a person to show deviant behavior or be pushed towards “deviant” peers (Becker 1963). Some of the memorable messages mentioned in table 2 can also become labels when they are internalized by victims. Victims believe they are deviant or not good enough for society and start showing “criminal” behavior by being trafficked or having a substance abuse issue. When a victim is labeled as a criminal society does not see the need for victim services but sees the need for more prisons. Internalized memorable messages and deviant behavior often lead victims to have a criminal record. This again shows society that they have been labeled as criminal and makes it very difficult for victims of trafficking to find safe housing, employment and the services they need. The stigma that comes with a criminal record
also makes it more difficult for victims to reintegrate into communities and may lead a victim to fall back into a trafficking situation.

Labeling and stigma can also lead to victims becoming perpetrators. Feiring, Miller-Johnson and Cleland (2014) found that there is a relationship between stigmatization by law enforcement, service organization and family, and internalizing symptoms of sexual abuse in youth. This leads to anger and delinquent behaviors in these youths. In addition, they found that the relation of anger and delinquency could be facilitated by interactions with deviant peers. So, through labeling, stigmatization and misidentification by law enforcement and service organizations, victims of trafficking have built up trauma which can lead to deviant behavior. Participant 9 said about this:

So, these kids never get the help they need and trauma keeps building and they become very vulnerable and become targets for traffickers. And then eventually they could be vulnerable and eventually then predators as well. Perpetrators instead (Family Member).

Feiring, Miller-Johnson and Cleland (2014) confirmed this observation with their study. They found that the stigmatization sexually abused youth experience leads to intensely negative, self-directed thoughts and feelings which can be turned outward to other people. This anger and antisocial behavior directed toward others may happen as a process of self-defense by turning the situation around and finding power and self-worth in victimizing someone else. This shows that labels society puts on victims of trafficking and the stigmatization a lot of these victims go through may have severe consequences. Not only for the victims themselves but also for potential others.
Conclusion
This study’s aim was to identify the successes and challenges of Calltofreedom in addressing the needs of victims of sex trafficking and to get an understanding of how memorable messages and labels can prevent or encourage victims to look for help and stay out of trafficking situations. Calltofreedom is one of two organization in the state of South Dakota specializing in trafficking. They have become the expert in the state that many other social service and law enforcement organizations look at for help when they identify a situation of trafficking. This study found that while the needs of trafficking victims are relatively similar regardless of whether someone is trafficked in an urban or rural state, the degree of these needs varies for each victim depending on his or her circumstances. With more training and awareness around the state more victims will be identified and in need of resources. As one participant said: “If you identify victims we need to make sure we have the tools to help them” (Staff member Domestic violence and Sexual assault service organization). These tools are growing in South Dakota and the United States as a whole but much more is needed. This means more funding needs to go to organizations like Calltofreedom.

Calltofreedom is a very important resource in the community of Sioux Falls and is very successful in addressing the needs of their clients. They work hard on educating and creating awareness for the community and building relationships with other organizations. One of the take always from this research is that even though Calltofreedom in collaboration with other organizations is a success everybody is still learning. Human trafficking is a very complex issue that is not easy to understand, prevent or prosecute. Making things even more complicated for victims and advocates is
the recent signing of the FOSTA bill by President Donald Trump. This bill targets online sex trafficking through websites like Backpage.com. While this bill would ideally prevent minors and women from being trafficked online, it will also prevent law enforcement from using these websites as a tool to do sting operations and find and prosecute buyers of underaged boys and girls. Furthermore, it prevents women who got out of trafficking from advertising themselves online taking away their power and pushing the women to more unsafe options like street prostitution where they do not have the means to screen their clients or protect their own identities (Huffington post 2018). As prostitution is often the only job opportunity these men and women have or prostitution makes them feel empowered because they are in charge of their own bodies, this bill makes revictimization more likely. Advocates have been criticizing this bill because it will push both sex trafficking and voluntary sex work further underground. This will make it more challenging for services organization to identify trafficking victims and will increase the stigma on sex work in general.

Stigma, labeling and memorable messages were the second aim of this research. Memorable message can serve as a tool of prevention and identification of trafficking victims. Many service organizations and law enforcement agencies had never heard or thought about memorable messages. Creating training around memorable messages might create a tool in the future to counter the negative messages many victims have heard for years from their trafficker, family and friends. As law enforcement officers like highway patrol are often the first encounter with victims they need to know what to say to win the victims trust, let the victim see that he or she is in a dangerous situation and show that help is out there. By creating memorable messages for the public about human trafficking
we can take away the stigma society puts on victims. This stigma can be very damaging to victims and prevent them from coming forward. Creating positive labels instead of negative ones will be a way to create more public and government involvement. When victims are not labeled “criminal” or “deviant” governments are more likely to put funding into programs that will help them instead of investing money in more jails to locking them up. The positive labels will also work as a prevention tool as labeling theory describes that people start acting like the label society gives them (Becker 1963). So, by taking away negative labels and creating positive once people will act in a more positive way because they feel better about themselves.

This research shows that South Dakota is doing the best it can with the resources it has to combat human trafficking. This research can be a tool to show what is missing and what we can work on to prevent, protect and prosecute human trafficking in this state.
Limitations and future research

There are a few limitations to the research. First, the sample size is small. The findings of this research cannot be generalized to every trafficking victim or service provider. Future research should include a bigger sample of trafficking victims and service organizations to get a clearer picture of what the needs are and where the gaps in services lie. Another way to be able to generalize the results of this study to all trafficking victims is to include more states. Comparing rural to urban counties and cities gives us a better understanding of the resources out there and what is missing. It also gives us a better understanding of how different organizations work together and how we can learn from each other. Even though there already is a body of research in urban areas there is almost no research urban or rural that gives trafficking victims a voice. First hand data from trafficking victims about their experiences is a major gap that needs to be filled within the research. A second limitation is that this study only included women. Men are victims of trafficking too, and the resources that focus on this population is even more limited. More research on how trafficking affects men, what their specific need are and how these needs are addressed are a gap in research that needs to be filled. Understanding the difference between victimization between men and women can help start service organization specifically targeting men’s needs and can take away some of the heavy stigmatization men face about sexual abuse and exploitation.
References
Achbold, Carol A. 2013. “Policing the Patch: An Examination of the Impact of the Oil
Boom on Small Town Policing and Crime in Western North Dakota.” PHD
dissertation, North Dakota State University.


Exploratory Study of Adolescent Pimping Relationships.” *The Journal of Primary

Amnesty International. 2007. “Maze of Injustice: The Failure to Protect Indigenous
Women from Sexual Violence in the USA.” *Amnesty International USA.*

Identity? A Synthesis of Labeling and Identity Theory Perspectives on Identity

from the Effects of Sexual Exploitation and Related Trafficking.” *Oak Foundation
Geneva, Switzerland.*

Institute for International Studies*, University of Mississippi.

Adequacy of the Rokeach Value Survey.” *Journal of Personality and Social
Psychology*, 49(1):250–263.


Buckley, Damon. 2014. “Firsthand account of man camp in North Dakota from local tribal cop.” *Lakota country times*.


Brunovskis, Anette and Rebecca Surtees. 2007. “Leaving the Past Behind? When Victims of Trafficking Decline Assistance.” *Fafo AIS (Oslo) and NEXUS Institute (Washington)*.


Cole, Jennifer and Ginny Sprang. 2015. “Sex Trafficking of Minors in Metropolitan, Micropolitan and Rural Communities.” *Child Abuse & Neglect.* 40:113-123.


Davis, K. 2006. “Human trafficking and modern-day slavery in Ohio.” *Polaris Project*.


Fedina, Lisa. 2015. “Use and misuse of research in books on sex trafficking: implications for interdisciplinary researchers, practitioners and advocates.” *Trauma, violence and abuse*, 16(2): 188-198 Sage publications.


(http://www.noem.house.gov/index.cfm/sex-trafficking)

Noem, Kristy. 2014. “Trafficking bills passed”.


Ortega, Debora and Noël Busch-Armendariz. 2013. “In the Name of VAWA.” 


Polaris project. “2014 state ratings on human trafficking laws.” Retrieved from 

Polaris project. “2011 state rating on human trafficking laws.” Retrieved from 


Appendix A.

**Interview questions staff members “Calltofreedom”**

This interview is to get a better understanding of the work “Calltofreedom” does and what kind of services they offer to their clients. The answers you give are completely confidential but feel free to not answer any questions you feel uncomfortable with. This interview should take about 45 min-1.5 hours.

1) What is your current position within the “Calltofreedom”?
2) How long have you worked in this position?
3) How did you find out about this organization?
4) What does your position entail?
5) Can you describe a day at work?
6) What do you like most about your work?
7) What do you like least about your work?

8) What kind of services does “Calltofreedom” offer its clients?
9) How did “Calltofreedom” decide on the services to offer?
   a. What does not work well?
   b. Why does it not work well?
   c. How can it be improved?
   d. What does work well?
   e. Why does it work well?
   f. How can it be improved?

10) What other resources can “Calltofreedom” provide?

11) What other organizations do you work with in your position with calltofreedom?
12) Who decides what other organization to work with?
13) How do you communicate with these other organizations?
14) How do you ensure the client’s needs are met through working with other organizations?

15) In working with your clients what is most important to you?
**Memorable message prompt**

(We get a lot of messages every single day. Some of those messages become really memorable and we remember them word for word in deciding what to do in our lives. They help us to decide “I should or I shouldn’t do this.” Or after you do something the message helps you to decide “I probably shouldn't have done that” or “I am really proud of myself for doing that.” That is what we are going to ask you about now.)

16) What kind of message do you want your client to remember?
17) Why is this message so important?
18) Do you do anything specific to get this message across?
19) What motivates you to keep working at “Calltofreedom”?

**Interview questions clients “Calltofreedom”**

This interview is to get a better understanding of the work “Calltofreedom” does, what kind of services they offer to their clients and how these services connect with the needs of the client. The answers you give are completely confidential but feel free to not answer any questions you feel uncomfortable with. This interview should take about 45 min-1.5 hours.

1) How did you first hear about “Calltofreedom”?
2) How long have you been involved with “Calltofreedom”?
3) Can you describe a day at “Calltofreedom”?
4) What kind of activities are you involved in with “Calltofreedom”?
5) What resources did they provide for you?
6) What do you like about calltofreedom?
7) what do you dislike about calltofreedom?

8) What were your needs when you first came to “Calltofreedom”?
9) Were these needs met?
   a. What does not work well?
   b. Why does it not work well?
   c. How can it be improved?
   d. What does work well?
   e. Why does it work well?
f. How can it be improved?

10) Is “Calltofreedom” the first organization you got involved in for your rehabilitation process?
   a. If yes, what made you look for help?
   b. If not, what were you missing in other organizations?

11) Have you gotten in contact with other organization trough “Calltofreedom”?
   a. Which ones?

12) How to these organizations help you?

13) How do these organizations make sure they meet your needs?

   **Memorable message prompt**

14) Do you have any message that has become memorable to you that prevented you from seeking help after being trafficked?
   a. What is that message (word for word)?
   b. Who told you that message?

15) How did that message prevent you from seeking help or healing?

16) Do you have any message that has become memorable to you that you received since you started with C2F?
   a. What is that message (word for word)?
   b. Who told you that message?

17) Has the message helped you to do something that you were proud of?
18) Has message helped you stop from doing something that you would later regret?
19) Has the message come to mind when you did something that you were not proud of?

**Interview questions law enforcement and other organizations**

This interview is to get a better understanding of the work local law enforcement and other service organizations do, what kind of training they received, what kind of services they offer to their clients and how these services connect with the needs of the client. The answers you give are completely confidential but feel free to not answer any questions you feel uncomfortable with. This interview should take about 45 min-1.5 hours.

1) What kind of training have you received to recognize victim of trafficking?
2) Do you feel this training is sufficient?
a. What does not work well?
b. Why does it not work well?
c. How can it be improved?
d. What does work well?
e. Why does it work well?
f. How can it be improved?

3) When you have a suspicion of trafficking during your work what do you do?

4) When you find a victim of trafficking how do you help him/her?

5) What kind of services does your organization offer victims of trafficking?

6) How long have you worked with “Calltofreedom”?

7) How does this collaboration work?

8) What other organizations do you work with to help trafficking victims?

9) How do you collaborate with these organizations?

10) Do you feel that your organization meets the needs client have?
    a. What does not work well?
    b. Why does it not work well?
    c. How can it be improved?
    d. What does work well?
    e. Why does it work well?
    f. How can it be improved?

11) In working with your clients what is most important to you?

   Memorable message prompt

12) What kind of message do you want your client to remember?

13) Why is this message so important?

14) Do you do anything specific to get this message across?

15) What motivates you to keep working with victims of trafficking?
Appendix B

Human Subjects Committee

Human Subjects Approval Request  
South Dakota State University

_____Exempt  X Expedited Review  _____Committee Review

1. Principal investigator/researcher: Annelieke Sinnema Phone No. 605-651-5167  
E-mail address of researcher: annelieke.sinnema@sdstate.edu  
____ Faculty  X Graduate Student  ____ Undergraduate Student  ____ Not SDSU Researcher

If student, faculty advisor: Julie Yingling

College/School: Arts and Sciences Department: Sociology and Rural Studies

(Please use an additional sheet to list names and contact information for others involved with the project.)

2. Project title Challenges and successes in helping sex trafficked victims: An organizational analysis.

3. Sponsoring agency: NA

4. Project period (contact with participants): From 11/01/2016 To 31/05/2017

5. Location(s) of study "Call to Freedom" Sioux Falls

6. Number of human participants to be selected: 24

7. Types of participants to be selected (check all that apply):

___X Normal Adults  ___Pregnant Women  ___Prisoners

___Minors  ___Fetuses  ___Mentally Disabled or Delayed

8. Exemption requested? X Yes _____ No

If “yes”, indicate basis for exemption. For complete descriptions of the exempt categories of research, see:

http://www.sdstate.edu/research/compliance/humansubjects/index.cfm

___Educational Research  ___Educational Tests  ___Study of Existing Data
_X_ Survey/Interview Research  ___ Observational Research  ___ Food Tasting

(The above do not automatically make a project exempt; it may require expedited or full committee review.)

9. Will any drugs, chemical or biological agents be administered to human subjects?

___ Yes  _X_ No  If Yes, include documentation regarding safety from a source other than the manufacturer in METHODS.

10. Will specimens or samples of tissues, body fluids, or other substances be collected from participants?

___ Yes  _X_ No  If Yes, include details of collection, storage, labeling, use, and disposal in METHODS.

11. Has each investigator involved in the study completed CITI on-line training and filed a copy of the certificate in the Office of Research and Sponsored Programs?  _X_ Yes  ___ No

12. Research Protocol: Complete a description of the proposed study following instructions.

13. Informed Consent: Attach copies of all forms which will be used to obtain the legally effective informed consent of human subjects or their legal representatives, or justification why informed consent should be altered or waived.

14. Additional Materials: Attach a copy of all surveys, recruitment materials, and any other relevant documents.

Authorized Signatures:

Principal Investigator ___________________________   Date

____________________

I ___ do  _X_ do not wish to appear before the committee

Advisor (if student project) ______________________   Date 11-28-

16

Department Head or Dean _______________________   Date __11/28/16__
Appendix C
Participant Consent Form "Calltofreedom" staff and Law enforcement

Participation in a Research Project
South Dakota State University
Brookings, SD 57007
Department of Sociology and Rural Studies
Project Director Annelieke Sinnema Phone No. 605-651-5167
E-mail annelieke.sinnema@sdstate.edu Date 11-13-2016

Please read (listen to) the following information:

1. This is an invitation for you to participate in a research project under the direction of South Dakota State University.

2. The project is entitled "Challenges and success in helping sex trafficking victims: an organizational analysis".

3. The purpose of the project is to examine the challenges and successes of a sex trafficking service organization. First it will look at how the organization works and what services the organization offers their clients. Secondly it will compare the workings and services to the needs of their clients to get a better understanding of the level of success the organization has.

4. If you consent to participate, you will be involved in the following process which will take about 60 to 90 minutes of your time: a one-on-one interview and/or a focus group (focus groups will only include part of my sample).

5. Participation in this project is voluntary. You have the right to withdraw at any time without penalty or consequences. If you feel uncomfortable with any of the questions asked feel free to skip this question. If you have any questions, you may contact the project director at the number listed above.

6. There are no known risks to your participation in the study.

7. The benefits to you are a better understanding of the successes of the organization working with trafficking victims and an understanding of how other organizations work, better collaboration between different organizations and ultimately better victim services.
8. There is no compensation for your participation in this study.

9. Your responses are strictly confidential. When the data and analysis are presented, you will not be linked to the data by your name, title or any other identifying item.
As a research participant, I have read the above, have had any questions answered, and agree to participate in the research project. I will receive a copy of this form for my information.

Participant's Signature ______________________________ Date __________

Project Director's Signature __________________________ Date __________

If you have any questions regarding this study you may contact the Project Director. If you have questions regarding your rights as a participant, you can contact the SDSU Research Compliance Coordinator at (605) 688-6975 or SDSU.IRB@sdstate.edu.
This project has been approved by the SDSU Institutional Review Board, Approval No.: _______
Participant Consent Form "Calltofreedom" clients

Participation in a Research Project
South Dakota State University
Brookings, SD 57007

Department of Sociology and Rural Studies

Project Director Annelieke Sinnema
Phone No. 605-651-5167

E-mail annelieke.sinnema@sdstate.edu
Date 11-13-2016

Please read (listen to) the following information:

1. This is an invitation for you to participate in a research project under the direction of South Dakota State University.

2. The project is entitled "Challenges and success in helping sex trafficking victims: an organizational analysis".

3. The purpose of the project is to examine the challenges and successes of a sex trafficking service organization. First it will look at how the organization works and what services the organization offers their clients. Secondly it will compare the workings and services to the needs of their clients to get a better understanding of the level of success the organization has.

4. If you consent to participate, you will be involved in the following process which will take about 60 to 90 minutes of your time: a one-on-one interview and/or a focus group (focus groups will only include part of my sample).

5. Participation in this project is voluntary. You have the right to withdraw at any time without penalty or consequences. If you feel uncomfortable with any of the questions asked feel free to skip this question. If you have any questions, you may contact the project director at the number listed above.

6. There are minimal risks for your participation in the study. The questions will be about the services you have received and how you feel about your time working with CalltoFreedom rather than your past experiences. However, negative emotions may arise due to you needing CalltoFreedom which may cause distress. 

You do not have to talk about anything you do not wish to discuss.
7. The benefits to you are organization working together to the benefit of victim services. This study examines the successes and challenges of organizations that help victims of sex trafficking. The benefit to you will help to change victim services for the better.

8. There is a compensation of $50 for your participation in this study.

9. Your responses are strictly confidential. When the data and analysis are presented, you will not be linked to the data by your name, title or any other identifying item. As a research participant, I have read the above, have had any questions answered, and agree to participate in the research project. I will receive a copy of this form for my information.

If you have any questions regarding this study you may contact the Project Director. If you have questions regarding your rights as a participant, you can contact the SDSU Research Compliance Coordinator at (605) 688-6975 or SDSU.IRB@sdstate.edu. This project has been approved by the SDSU Institutional Review Board, Approval No.:
Dr. Yingling,

I would like to express my support for the ongoing collaboration between the Sociology Department and Call to Freedom. I look forward to working with your department on collecting and analyzing data related to trafficked men and women and the resources available to them through our organization. We have worked with Dr. Yingling and Annelieke Sinnema to address concerns about privacy and contact with clients and feel comfortable partnering in a research project.

Sincerely,

Becky Rasmussen